

Plotinus, *Enneads* IV.3, Problems concerning the soul, pt. 1 – chapter 1
Dhananjay Jagannathan
Ancient Greek & Roman Philosophy Workshop
9 October 2013

Outline of the chapter

ll. 1-4: the topic	ll. 18-22: two arguments they deny
ll. 4-8: the worth of the inquiry	ll. 22-23: Plato brought in for support
ll. 8-16: some further motivation	ll. 23-33: the first Platonic argument
ll. 16-18: the view of the opponents	ll. 33-37: a second Platonic argument

Some framing questions

1. What is the nature of the priority implied in ll. 10-12 between inquiring into other matters and inquiring into the nature of what inquires? Temporal/causal? *δικαίως* suggests something stronger – logical/epistemological?

2. Who are the opponents Plotinus has in mind in the second half of the chapter? What, precisely, is their view? (Note especially what the arguments *contra* in 18-22 aim to establish.)

SVF i.459 (beware the typo in the apparatus!): Critolaus apud Philonem περὶ ἀφθαρείας κόσμου (248, 2): τί δήποτ' οὐχὶ καὶ τὴν τοῦ κόσμου φύσιν λεκτέον εἶναι μακροαίωνα 'τὴν τάξιν τῶν ἀτάκτων, τὴν ἁρμονίαν τῶν ἀναρμόστων, τὴν συμφωνίαν τῶν ἀσυμφώνων, τὴν ἔνωσιν τῶν διεστηκότων, τὴν ξύλων μὲν καὶ λίθων ἔξιν, σπαρτῶν τε καὶ δένδρων φύσιν, ψυχὴν δὲ ζώων ἀπάντων, ἀνθρώπων δὲ νοῦν καὶ λόγον, ἀρετὴν δὲ σπουδαίων τελειοτάτην;

SVF ii.774 = DL vii.156 (Zeno): Δοκεῖ δ' αὐτοῖς τὴν μὲν φύσιν εἶναι πῦρ τεχνικόν, ὁδῶ βαδίζον εἰς γένεσιν, ὅπερ ἐστὶ πνεῦμα πυροειδὲς καὶ τεχνοειδές· τὴν δὲ ψυχὴν αἰσθητικὴν <φύσιν>. ταύτην δ' εἶναι τὸ συμφυὲς ἡμῖν πνεῦμα· διὸ καὶ σῶμα εἶναι καὶ μετὰ τὸν θάνατον ἐπιμένειν· φθαρτὴν δ' ὑπάρχειν, τὴν δὲ τῶν ὅλων ἀφθαρτον, ἧς μέρη εἶναι τὰς ἐν τοῖς ζώοις.

3. How many Platonic arguments are there in the second half of the chapter, three or two? The analogy mentioned in ll. 31-33 seems to fit quite closely with the initial citation of Plato at ll. 23-26, but since this passage is divided from the next quite clearly distinct argument by καὶ at l. 33, just as it is divided from the previous bit at l. 26, it's hard to tell.

Tim. 30b4-c1: διὰ δὴ τὸν λογισμὸν τόνδε νοῦν μὲν ἐν ψυχῇ, ψυχὴν δ' ἐν σώματι συνιστὰς τὸ πᾶν συνετεκταίνεται, ὅπως ὅτι κάλλιστον εἶη κατὰ φύσιν ἄριστόν τε ἔργον ἀπειρωγασμένος. οὕτως οὖν δὴ κατὰ λόγον τὸν εἰκότα δεῖ λέγειν τόνδε τὸν κόσμον ζῶον ἔμψυχον ἔννοον τε τῇ ἀληθείᾳ διὰ τὴν τοῦ θεοῦ γενέσθαι πρόνοιαν.

4. What on earth do ll. 35-36 mean, esp. the cryptic μετὰ τὴν τοῦ ὅλου [sc. ψυχὴν]?