

## *Geographia Rabbinica: The Toponym Barbaria\**

DAVID M. GOLDENBERG  
*University of Pennsylvania*

Several Rabbinic sources of late antiquity refer to a place or places called *Barbaria* or to people called *barbarim*. Generally, scholars have understood these terms as common nouns ('barbarian country', 'barbarians'), and infrequently as toponyms or gentilics. When they are seen as toponyms or gentilics, they are usually understood in a uniform way as all referring to the same place and the same people, usually Barbary and the Berbers in North Africa. However, Greco-Roman sources indicate, in addition to the common noun and adjective, a number of different places called 'Barbaria'. Other, much older, sources (Egyptian inscriptions and cuneiform texts) of the Ancient Near East refer to still other such place-names as well as mentioning some of those found in the Greco-Roman sources. It is the aim of this paper to re-examine the various Rabbinic references to *Barbaria* in light of the geographical background provided by these other sources.

### I. *Barbaria(n) as Common Noun and Adjective*

In Greek and Latin sources of classical and late antiquity the common nouns and adjectives based on the root *barbar* (e.g. *barbaria*, *barbaries*, *barbaricum*, *barbarus*, etc.) are regularly found as designating foreign lands and their inhabitants, whether in general or in reference to a specific land (Phrygia, Persia, Scythia, etc.). Often, the word carries the connotation of barbarity, a lack of civilization.<sup>1</sup>

\* My thanks are due to Glen Bowersock and Shaye Cohen, who read drafts of this paper and made valuable suggestions toward its improvement. I am also indebted to my colleagues Sol Cohen and Gary Rendsburg, respectively, for their help with some cuneiform and Egyptian texts dealt with below.

<sup>1</sup> The Greek lexicographers, following Strabo (14.2.28), generally explain the etymology of *barbar* as a Greek onomatopoeic mimicking of the nonsense sound of foreigners' unintelligible speech. See e.g. P. Chantraine, *Dictionnaire étymologique de la langue grecque: histoire des mots* (Paris, 1968–80; nouveau tirage 1990), 1:165, s.v. However some think the Greek is derived from Near Eastern (Sumerian and Akkadian) languages. See G. Dossin, 'Grèce et Orient', *Revue Belge de Philologie et d'Histoire* 49 (1971), pp. 5–7 with literature cited in n. 1, and P. Fronzaroli, 'A Semitic Etymological Dictionary', in his (ed.) *Studies on Semitic Lexicography* (Florence, 1973), p. 18. So Jacob Levy, *Wörterbuch über die Talmudim und Midraschim* (2nd ed., Berlin and Vienna, 1924; originally published 1876–89), 1:260, s.v., who sees the origin in a reduplicated Semitic *br*, 'external, foreign' i.e. to the civilized hearer. See now the entry 'bar A' in *The Sumerian Dictionary* (Philadelphia, 1984– ), ed. Åke W. Sjöberg et al., 2(B): 106b–07a. Indo-European specialists, on the other hand, see *barbar* and *balbal* as dissimilated forms of *baba* which is a widespread term for inarticulated 'baby' talk; see J. Pokorny, *Indogermanisches Etymologisches Wörterbuch* (Bern, 1959), s.v. *baba*. Similarly—'babbling, onomatopoeic'—for Sanskrit: M. Mayrhofer, *Etymologisches Wörterbuch des Altindoarischen*, vol. 2 (Heidelberg, 1993), pp. 217–18, s.v. *balbalā*, where reference is made to *Barbarā*- as the name of a river and *barburā*- as possibly the word for 'water'

The same word and range of meaning is found commonly in Rabbinic literature of late antiquity, that is a designation (general or specific) for foreign lands, often with the connotation of barbarity:

- (1) 'A parable of a king's son who was captured by the barbarians ...' (*ExodR* 20.14), or '... who went to *brbry'h*' (*ExodR* 18.6).
- (2) 'The barbarians came and joined conflict' (*LevR* 11.7, ed. Margoliot 1:229, *RuthR* Introduction 7 = *GenR* 41.3, ed. Theodor-Albeck 1:400).
- (3) 'Instead of conquering the barbarians, conquer the Jews' (*ySuk* 1.5, 55b; *LamR* 1.16, 4.19, ed. Buber, pp. 83, 152; etc.).
- (4) '*Nqyṯh brbrwn*' = transliterated Greek *νικητά βαρβαρῶν* (Jastrow), 'O

assuming that *bar-bar-* indicates the sound of babbling water; cf. p. 217, s.v. *balbūtha-* and 230–31, s.v. *brbū-*.

In his *Chaldäisches Wörterbuch über die Targumim* (Leipzig, 1867–68), 1:113, s.v. 'barbarai', Levy suggests another Semitic origin: < *bbl* < *bll*, although H. L. Fleischer took strong exception and argued for a universal onomatopoeic explanation ('Nachträgliches' 1:420 in the second edition of the *Wörterbuch über die Targumim*, 1924). (R. Payne Smith, *Thesaurus Syriacus* (Oxford, 1879), 1:603, writing before Fleischer's additions, incorporated Levy's comments.) Cf. pAmh63, an Aramaic text in Demotic writing found on papyrus, where we find the toponym *brbr* (col. xvii), which the editors of the text note is an error for *bbr* (occurring elsewhere in the same column). *Bbr* is really *bbl* (Babylon), since the Demotic *r* expresses both Aramaic phonetic values *r* and *l*. See, for example, col. xviii: *mlk mnbb*, i.e. *mlk mn-bbl*, 'king of Babylonia'. (The text: R. C. Steiner and C. F. Nims, 'Ashurbanipal and Shamash-shum-ukin: A Tale of Two Brothers from the Aramaic Text in Demotic Script', *RB* 92 (1985), p. 71; see also the translation of S. P. Vleeming and J. W. Wesseliuss, *Studies in Papyrus Amherst 63*, vol. 1 (Amsterdam, 1985), p. 34. Discussion on *brbr*: Steiner and Nims, 'A Paganized Version of Psalm 20:2–6 from the Aramaic Text in Demotic Script', *JAOS* 103 (1983), p. 262.)

G. Bowersock has suggested another possible etymology, at least for some of the Barbaria toponyms. He noted Androsthenes' (fourth century B.C.E.) report that the natives of the Arabian Gulf refer to the pearl producing shellfish as *berberi*, and he conjectured that there might be a connection between this word and (a) the toponym Barbaria, a name given to 'the coastal areas of the Arabian Sea and Gulf, precisely where the pearl-fishers flourished'; (b) the village of Bārbār in the north of Bahrain (see *TAVO* B iv 13); and (c) Abarbarē, a water-nymph of Tyre ('Tylos and Tyre: Bahrain in the Graeco-Roman World', in *Bahrain through the Ages: The Archaeology*, ed. H. A. Al Khalifa and M. Rice (London, 1986), pp. 404–05; repr. in Bowersock, *Studies on the Eastern Roman Empire* (Goldbach, 1994), pp. 272–73). On the other hand, D. T. Potts is of the opinion that the Bahrain Barbar derives its name from the nearby ancient temple, which Potts thinks was one of the temples to Shamash, the sun god, that were known as *ē-babbar*, 'white house' ('Barbar Miscellanies', in his (ed.) *Dilmun: New Studies in the Archaeology and Early History of Bahrain* (Berlin, 1983), pp. 127–28; idem, *The Arabian Gulf in Antiquity* (Oxford, 1990), p. 172).

Regarding the toponym **Barbarei** (Ptolemy 7.1.59) = **Barbarikon**, **Barbarikē** in India (*Periplus Maris Erythraei* 38, 39, 41; see ed. Huntingford, p. 108, and ed. Casson, p. 188), Tomaschek, *RE* 2.2855 would derive the name from a Dravidian tribe *Barbar* or *Vorvara*. Similarly, W. H. Schoff, *Periplus*, p. 165. For the location—a region and city in Indoskythai, south of Patala on an island at the mouth of the Indus on the northwest coast of India—see J. E. Schwartzberg, *A Historical Atlas of South Asia* (Chicago, 1978), Index, s.v. *Barbara*. *TAVO* B v 4, B v 8, B vi 7, cf. B vii 6 and 8. Cf. also **Barābar** (Northeast India, below the Ganges River) mentioned in an Asoka inscription from the third century B.C.E. (*Grosser Historischer Weltatlas*, Map 48b. See *The Cambridge History of India*, Index, s.v. 'Barābar Hills').

On the usage and history of 'barbarian' as a common noun and adjective in classical sources, see J. Jüthner, *Hellenen und Barbaren* (Leipzig, 1923), Y. A. Dauge, *Le Barbare: recherches sur la conception romaine de la barbarie et de la civilisation* (Bruxelles, 1981), and, for Latin usage, T. J. Haarhof, *The Stranger at the Gate* (London, 1938), pp. 216–21.

Conqueror of the barbarians!’ (*LamR*, Introduction 23, ed. Buber, p. 11b = *Qohelet Zuta* 12.5, ed. Buber, p. 77b).<sup>2</sup>

- (5) A parable ‘like a king whose city (*medinah*) revolted. He sends legions (*ligyonot*) to surround the people, closing off the water supply. If that works, fine. If not, he sends in the mercenaries (*ql’nym*).<sup>3</sup> If that works, fine. If not, he sends in the archers. If that works, fine. If not, he sends in the barbarians’ (*Tanḥuma*, *Bo*’ 4 = *Tanḥuma* ed. Buber, *Bo*’ 4, which has however ‘legions’ a second time for ‘barbarian’). Here ‘barbarian’ means ‘foreign troops’ (see Lieberman, ‘Palestine in the Third and Fourth Centuries’, *JQR* 36 (1946), p. 355, and J. Fürst, *Glossarium*, pp. 86–87 and ‘Zur Erklärung griechischer Lehnwörter in Talmud und Midrasch’, *MGWJ* 38 (1894), p. 308).
- (6) As a term of contempt depicting the uncivilized: ‘Do you think that Shimon ben Shetaḥ is a barbarian?!’ (*yBM* 2.5, 8c; so the correct reading, see Lieberman in *Yerushalmi Neziqin Edited from the Escorial Manuscript* (Jerusalem, 1983), ed. E. S. Rosenthal with S. Lieberman, pp. 48 and 135). Similarly said of biblical Mordecai (*EstR* to 2:21).
- (7) Targum to Ps. 114:1 translates ‘*am lo’ez* (a people of strange speech) as ‘*ame barbera’e*, ‘a foreign people’.
- (8) A midrashic interpretation of Ps. 140:9 says that God muzzled, or restrained, Rome by means of ‘the barbarians and the Germans whom the Romans fear’ (*GenR* 75.9, ed. Theodor-Albeck 2:887, *bMeg* 6a–b; variants to ‘Germans’: *grmmyh*, *grmwny*, *grmwmy*). ‘Barbarians (*br-brym*) and Germans’ apparently reflects the historical situation of the fifth-century invasions of the northern Germanic peoples (the Vandals and Goths).<sup>4</sup>

<sup>2</sup> Also in some versions of *GenR* 10.7 (see ed. Theodor-Albeck, 1:83), including MS Vat. 60, facsimile ed. Makor: Jerusalem, 1972, p. 30b. In addition to Buber’s and Theodor’s notes, see S. Lieberman, ‘Qales qilusin’, *Alei Ayin: The Salman Schocken Jubilee Volume* (in Hebrew; Tel Aviv, 1951/52), p. 76, reprinted in *Studies in Palestinian Talmudic Literature* (in Hebrew; Jerusalem, 1991), p. 434; and S. Krauss, *Persia and Rome in the Talmud and Midrash* (in Hebrew; Jerusalem, 1947), p. 85.

<sup>3</sup> So Levy, *Wörterbuch über die Talmudim* 4:313, based on Du Cange, *Glossarium ad scriptores mediae et infimae graecitatis* (1688) 1:685, s.v. κολονός = ὁ μιθωτάς.

<sup>4</sup> In Christian Europe of the fourth and fifth centuries the ‘barbarian’ usually referred to the Germanic and Goth invaders; see W. R. Jones, ‘The Image of the Barbarian in Medieval Europe’, *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 13 (1971), pp. 381 ff. The various talmudic dictionaries may explain one or another of these eight cited sources as referring to a place-name. See under *brbr* and its derivatives in Levy, *Wörterbuch über die Talmudim und Midraschim*; J. Fürst, *Glossarium Graeco-Hebraeum oder der griechische Wörterschatz der jüdischen Midraschwerke* (Strassburg, 1890), pp. 86–87; M. Jastrow, *Dictionary*, p. 190; Kohut, *Arukh ha-Shalem* 2:183–84, where some no-longer extant sources are also quoted, q.v.

## II. *Barbaria(n) as Toponym and Gentilic*<sup>5</sup>

To be sure, some references to a *Barbaria* in Rabbinic sources, although clearly toponyms, evade identification. Such are the following cases.

(1) *Barburim* in 1 Kings 5:3 is interpreted as birds ('of) from *Barbaria* (*QohR* 2.7, possibly in the name of R. Judah b. Simon, a fourth-century Palestinian).<sup>6</sup> Clearly a toponym is intended and it is tempting to identify this *Barbaria* with the cuneiform place-name **Barbarranamsu** (or **Barbarranamba**, or **Parparrahupa**) in Elamite territory mentioned in a text from the third dynasty of Ur (2111–2003 B.C.E.),<sup>7</sup> since the values *nam* or *hu* are both represented by bird logograms.<sup>8</sup> But this would require us to assume that the ultimate source for the Rabbinic statement read cuneiform, and, while a recent study suggests that cuneiform was still read by Babylonian priests in the third century C.E.,<sup>9</sup> our Rabbinic source derives, at least in its present form, from Palestine, and from a later period.<sup>10</sup>

(2) Possibly 'the *brbrym* and the Germans whom the Romans fear' (*GenR* 75.9; above, I.8) and 'a parable of a king whose son went to *brbry'h* and the *brbryym* arose and ...' (*ExodR* 18.6, above I.1) also refer to gentilics and toponyms and not common nouns, although precise identification is not possible.

In other cases we are in a position to ascertain the identities or, at least, to come closer to an identification:

(3) 'Twice [in biblical times] the sea rose and inundated the world. How far did it rise the first time and how far the second? R. Yudan, R. Abbahu, and R. Elazar in the name of R. Ḥanina: the first time it rose until Acco and until Jaffa; the second time until the cliffs (*kypy*) of *Barbaria*. R. Huna and R. Aḥa in the name of R. Ḥanina: the first time until the cliffs of *Barbaria*; the second time until Acco and Jaffa ... R. Elazar: the first time until Calabria

<sup>5</sup> In the following citations I have generally used the sixth century as a cut-off date. Some references to *brbr* toponyms in sources after that date (e.g. Barbathe and Barbaros in the Fayūm in the seventh and eighth centuries) can be found in Calderini, *Dizionario* 2:32–33.

<sup>6</sup> See Kohut, 'Arukh 2:184, nn. 1–2 for parallels.

<sup>7</sup> *RGTC* 2:26, C. Virolleaud in *ZA* 19 (1906), pp. 383–84, H. Waetzoldt in *ZA* 65 (1975), p. 272. Probably to be identified with another cuneiform toponym, **Barbanazu**, and possibly with yet another, **Barbalaz** (D. Owen in *JCS* 33 (1981), p. 248).

<sup>8</sup> R. Labat, *Manuel d'épigraphie akkadienne*, rev. ed. F. Malbran-Labat (Paris, 1976), pp. 72–75.

<sup>9</sup> M. J. Geller, 'The Last Wedge', *ZA* 87 (1997), pp. 43–95. I am grateful to Gary Beckman for bringing this article to my attention.

<sup>10</sup> The understanding that *barburim* refers to birds may derive from knowledge of the Arabic 'abū *burbur* 'cuckoo', or *birbir* 'young chickens', an etymology echoed in modern biblical criticism. See L. Koehler and W. Baumgartner, *Hebräisches und aramäisches Lexikon zum alten Testament*, Mitarbeit von B. Hartmann und E. Kutscher, 3rd ed. (Leiden, 1974–95), s.v. *Barbur* (English translation: K.-B. and Johann J. Stamm, *The Hebrew and Aramaic Lexicon of the Old Testament*, transl. M. E. J. Richardson, Leiden, 1994– ), and P. Fronzaroli 'A Semitic Etymological Dictionary', in *Studies on Semitic Lexicography*, p. 18. Mandelbaum (*PesRK* 1:113) thinks that *brbryh* in the Rabbinic source = Gk. βιβρία, Lt. *vivaria*.

and the second until the cliffs of Barbaria' (*GenR* 23.7, pp. 228–29, *ySheq* 6.2, 50a).<sup>11</sup> Most assume that this description is one of the Atlantic overflowing into, and creating, the Mediterranean in two stages,<sup>12</sup> although Theodor notes that this interpretation would not hold for R. Hanina's east-to-west movement (Acco/Jaffa first, Barbaria second). He therefore advances another interpretation for this view whereby 'sea' is the Mediterranean, although it is not clear to me why this should help matters.<sup>13</sup>

Whatever the case, almost all those who comment on this text identify Barbaria with the Berbers of North Africa.<sup>14</sup> However, there is some debate about when the gentilic 'Berber' came into use. Most scholars see the term as a direct Arabic derivation from Latin *barbarus*, the generic term used by the Romans in pre-Arab times to describe the local population. The Arabs adopted the term to designate the area and inhabitants of North Africa west of Egypt. According to this generally accepted view, then, the term 'Berber' does not predate the Arab conquest of the seventh century.<sup>15</sup> Gabriel Camps, however, feels that 'Berber' is derived from 'Barbares', the name of a North African people, by contamination with the Latin *barbarus*.<sup>16</sup> Indeed, the name **Barbares** is found in texts from the fourth to fifth centuries<sup>17</sup> as a variant form of the name **Bavares**, a people of Mauretania Tingitana and/or Caesarien-

<sup>11</sup> On the spelling of the name Barbaria in *ySheq* (*brbryyh* or *brbr'y'h*), see Y. Sussman, 'Mesoret Limud ... Sheqalim', in *Mehqarim be-Sifrut ha-Talmudit: Yom 'Iyyun ... Lieberman* (Jerusalem, 1983), p. 73 to 50a.

<sup>12</sup> See e.g. Theodor-Albeck's notes *ad loc.*, A. Neubauer, *Le Géographie du Talmud* (Paris, 1868), p. 412, and W. Bacher, *Die Agada der palästinensischen Amoräer* (Strassberg, 1896); Hebrew translation: 'Aggadot 'Amora'e 'Ereš Yisra'el (Tel Aviv, 1928), 1a:24. On the exegesis behind the statements, see the literature cited by Y. Sussman, *op. cit.*, p. 55.

<sup>13</sup> It may be that the passage is not based on an east–west or west–east flow but on height, with the coasts of Calabria, Barbaria and Acco/Jaffa representing different heights. Arguing against this possibility, however, is that Calabria (the Roman 'heel of Italy') is not particularly known for its great heights. In fact, Virgil refers to it as 'low-lying Italy' (*Aeneid* 3.522).

<sup>14</sup> See the talmudic dictionaries, Neubauer, p. 412, and P. S. Alexander, *The Toponymy of the Targumim with Special Reference to the Table of Nations and the Boundaries of the Land of Israel* (Ph.D. diss., Univ. of Oxford, 1974), p. 114. Jastrow is the exception taking Barbaria to refer to the east coast of Africa, a view which, given the Mediterranean context, is equally unacceptable. See also H. Z. Hirschberg, *A History of the Jews in North Africa* (2nd ed., Leiden, 1974), 1:33–34, dealing with texts which we shall discuss below.

<sup>15</sup> S. Gsell, *Histoire ancienne de l'Afrique du nord* 1:336–37 and 5:112–15, where literature is surveyed. Similarly, C. Pellat in *EI*<sup>2</sup> 1:1173a, s.v. Berbers; S. Weinstock in *RE* 14:2350, s.v. Mauretania; D. T. Potts, 'Barbar Miscellanies', in his (ed.) *Dilmun: New Studies in the Archaeology and Early History of Bahrain*, p. 127; and most forcefully M. Fantar in F. Devret and M. Fantar, *L'Afrique du nord dans l'antiquité* (Paris, 1981), p. 27. See also Alexander, *Toponymy of the Targumim*, p. 113.

<sup>16</sup> G. Camps, *Berbères: aux marges de l'histoire* (Paris, 1980), pp. 86–87. Earlier support for the view that 'Berber' is an original ethnic designation is found in Isaac Taylor, *Words and Places*, ed. A. Smythe Palmer (London, 1909), p. 281 and the literature cited in n. 4. Note also F. C. Movers's comment about 'Marmaridae' possibly being related to 'Berber' (*Die Phönizier* (Berlin, 1850), 2/2: 391). The Marmaridae were located in the north of Africa to the west of the Nile (see Desange, *Catalogue*, pp. 164–65, for location).

<sup>17</sup> Julius Honorius, *Cosmographia* A 47, A 48 (var. **Barbaricen(s)**, **Barbarigens**), B 48 (**Barbaricenses**), ed. Riese, *Geog. Lat. Min.*, pp. 53–54; *Liber generationis* 197.67 (*Chronographus anni* 353), ed. Mommsen, p. 107; ed. Riese, p. 167; *Laterculus Veronensis*, ed. Riese, p. 129; ed. Seeck, *Notitia Dignitatum*, p. 252.

sis, who possibly appear also under the name **Babari**.<sup>18</sup> Therefore, whether or not the term 'Berber' derives from **Barbares** / **Bavares**, there were people in North Africa of the fourth century known by the name **Barbares** or **Bavares**. Furthermore, if the Latin personal name **Barbarus**, found in North Africa from the first century B.C.E. to the second century C.E., derives from a geographic toponym(s), rather than from a common noun or adjective (the land of the barbarians, uncivilized), as Ingholt argues, it would provide even earlier proof for the place-name **Barbaria** (*aut sim.*).<sup>19</sup> Thus the Rabbinic toponym **Barbaria** in the text under discussion could refer to the land of these people.

However, there is a strong argument against such identification, for the Rabbinic story parallels **Barbaria** with cities or towns (**Acco**, **Jaffa**, **Calabria**), which would seem to indicate a limited area, not the broad expanse of the northwest African coast. Perhaps the toponym **Barbaricum** mentioned in a late fourth-century document as being near **Mauretania**,<sup>20</sup> refers to a more limited area, but we do not know if this site is on the coast, which is indicated by the Rabbinic text. A similar objection may be raised against the possibility that the Rabbinic reference is to the toponym **Barbaria** mentioned in an inscription from the first century C.E. as a place somewhere in Sardinia (*civitates Barbariae*), whose inhabitants are termed **Barbaricini**.<sup>21</sup> A more likely candidate for identification with the Rabbinic text might be the place **Barbariana** in Hispania Baetica, on the southern Mediterranean coast of Spain.<sup>22</sup>

<sup>18</sup> Desange, *Catalogue des tribus africaines*, pp. 46, 47–48, note also 63; Gsell, *Histoire ancienne de l'Afrique du nord* 5:114; G. Camps, 'Les Bavares, Peuples de Maurétanie Césarienne', *Revue Africaine* 99 (1955), pp. 245 and 263–64; J. A. Ilevbare, *Carthage, Rome, and the Berbers* (Ibadan, 1980), p. 10; C. Tissot, *Géographie comparée de la province romaine d'Afrique* (Paris, 1884) 1:460; Dessau, *RE* 3:149–50. Note also Camps's (*Berberes*, p. 189) reference to the **Braber**, a people of the Middle Atlas. Presumably these are the **Berabra** on the Atlantic coast of Morocco referred to by Schoff, *Periplus*, p. 56. In an appendix to his article 'Les Bavares' (pp. 285–88), Camps has reproduced the epigraphic and literary references to the **Bavares**. On the relationship of these names to the **Babors** mountain chain, see Camps, pp. 243, 270–71 (cf. also the river **Vabar** in **Numidia** mentioned by *Mela* 1.6). On the spelling of the toponym with and without *r*, see the discussion below at n. 47.

<sup>19</sup> H. Ingholt, 'Varia Tadmorea' in *Palmyre: bilan et perspectives* (Strasbourg, 1976), pp. 106–11. Ingholt also includes in this category the woman's name **Barbarah** found on a Palmyrene inscription dated 188 C.E. For the generally accepted view that **Barbarus** denotes 'uncivilized' or 'from the country of the uncivilized', see L. R. Dean, *A Study of the Cognomina of Soldiers in the Roman Legions* (Princeton, 1916), p. 117, and Iiro Kajanto, *The Latin Cognomina* (Helsinki, 1965), pp. 312–13.

<sup>20</sup> *Concilia Africana*, canon 52 (397 C.E.): 'De provincia Mauritania, propterea quod in finibus Africae sit, nihil statuimus, siquidem vicinae sunt Barbarico' ('Regarding the province of Mauritania, since it is situated in the territories of Africa we have decided nothing inasmuch as they [territories of Africa?] inhabitants of Mauretania? are near to Barbarico'). Quoted by Alexander, *Toponymy of the Targumim*, pp. 113 and 355, from Du Cange, *Glossarium mediae et infimae Latinitatis* (Paris, 1840), s.v. **Barbaricum**. Text in CCSL 149 (*Concilia Africae A. 345–A. 525*, ed. C. Munier), p. 189. Cf. *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers*, Second Series, ed. Philip Schaff and Henry Wace, 1890–99 ('American edition'), repr. 1994, 14:466 (H. R. Percival). Is the modern Cape of **Barbas** in Western Sahara (Grosvenor-Darley, p. 130 D2) related?

<sup>21</sup> Procopius, *Bell. Pers.* 13.44, *De aed.* 6.7.13, and other sources; see Hülsen, *RE* 2:2857, s.v. 'Barbaricini'; *TLL* 1731; Hammond 18b Bd; *Grosser Historischer Weltatlas* . . . , Map 40/41.

<sup>22</sup> *Itin. Ant.* 406 = **Bamaliana**. *Anon. Rav.* 4.42.21 (PP 305.10) and 5.4.39 (PP 344.4). Cf. **Barbesula** (Hübner, *RE* 3:3), shown in H. Kiepert, *Atlas Antiquus*, X Ec, as being in the same location more or less. Cf. also **Barba**, *Itin. Ant.* 412, in southern Spain, now El Castillon near Anticaria

But the most likely possibilities are two other places. First is a **Barbarion Promontory** (*ἄκρον*) mentioned by Strabo 3.3.1, Ptolemy 2.5.3, and Marcian 2.13 (first, second and third century respectively), as being in Lusitania, south of the mouth of the Tagus River on the west coast of Spain.<sup>23</sup> The second is a **Barbari Promontory** (*promuntorium*) (var. **Barbiti**) mentioned in the *Itinerarium Antoninianum* 10 (third century) as a station on the route on the north coast of Mauretania, east of Tingis, i.e. close to the Straits of Gibraltar.<sup>24</sup> In view of the fact that *kypy* nicely translates both *ἄκρον* and *promuntorium*, it would appear that the Rabbinic '*kypy* (cliffs) Barbaria' is either *promuntorium Barbari* in North Africa at the western end of the Mediterranean (*Itin. Ant.*) or *Βαρβάριον ἄκρον* on the southwest coast of Spain (Strabo, Ptolemy, Marcian). Either of these is possible, and either would accord well with the story. If we accept the interpretation that sees the Rabbinic story as speaking of the Atlantic flowing into the Mediterranean, then we are left with but one possibility: Barbari Promontory on the north coast of Mauretania.

(4) 'R. Shimon b. Laqish was checking figs in *Brbryt*' (*yMQ* 3.1, 81d; cf. *bMQ* 17a). Scholarly consensus today identifies this site with an Arab village **Barbara** just southeast of Ashkelon.<sup>25</sup> The Arab village is mentioned by V. Guérin in his historical geography of Palestine written a century ago.<sup>26</sup> Although Guérin mentions the existence of ancient ruins at the site, I have not found in the secondary literature a reference to the village of that name before the publication of Guérin's volume in 1869. However, S. Klein pointed

(*TLL* 1728; *TAVO* B vi 18). See Hübner, *RE* 2:2856; Miller, *Itineraria Romana*, p. 184; Smith 1:377; Jacobsohn, *TLL* 1731; Hammond, 28 Ef. **Barbariana** in Hispania Baetica should not be confused with another site of the same name in Hispania Tarraconensis (northeast Spain) mentioned in *Itin. Ant.* 450, on which see Hübner, *RE* 2:2856; Jacobsohn, *TLL* 1731; K. Miller, *Itineraria Romana*, p. 174. (Incidentally *TLL* 1728 is in error when it cites **Barbara Island** (in the middle of the Saône, near Lyon; see A. Longnon, *Géographie de la Gaule au VIe siècle* (Paris, 1878), p. 199), as appearing in Gregory of Tours (sixth century), *De gloria martyrum*. It is rather in Gregory's *De gloria confessorum* 22.)

<sup>23</sup> Hübner, *RE* 2:2858; Smith 1:377; Hammond 25a Bc. Ptolemy is in ed. Müller-Fischer, p. 132.

<sup>24</sup> See Dessau, *RE* 2:2858.

<sup>25</sup> See Y. Tsafrir, L. Di Segni, J. Green *et al.*, *Tabula Imperii Romani: Iudaea-Palestina* (Jerusalem, 1994), p. 74, and G. Reeg, *Die Ortsnamen Israels nach der rabbinischen Literatur* (Wiesbaden, 1989), pp. 148–49, both with cited literature ('Barâra' given as the name of the Arab village in M. Avi-Yonah, *Gazetteer of Roman Palestine* (Qedem 5: Jerusalem 1976), p. 35, is presumably an error). *TAVO* B vi 10 and 16; B x 12. Earlier views, not aware of the Arab village, identified *Brbryt* with Barbarissos in Syria: Solomon Judah Rapoport, '*Erekh Millin* 1:29, s.v. 'irybwlywys, and following him, Neubauer (p. 301) and Kohut ('*Arukh* 2:184); so also Hirschensohn, *Sheba' Hokhamot*, p. 83a. S. Klein apud I. Löw, *Die Flora 5: Juden* (Vienna and Leipzig, 1926) 1:226, and following him S. Krauss (in Kohut, '*Arukh*, Supplement Volume, p. 105), identify the place with Barbara 'southeast of Jaffe' (?). Did they have in mind the Arab village Barbara, which is however southwest of Jaffe, or **Khirbet el-Babariyye**, which is northeast of Jaffe and northwest of Shechem (Nablus), about halfway along the Shechem–Tulkarm road. Archaeological finds indicate occupation at this site from the Iron Age through the Roman, Byzantine, and medieval periods: R. Gophna and Y. Porat in *Judaea, Samaria, and the Golan: Archaeological Survey 1967–68*, ed. M. Kochavi (in Hebrew) (Jerusalem, 1972), p. 222, no. 126.

<sup>26</sup> *Description géographique, historique, et archéologique de la Palestine: Judée* (Paris, 1869–80) 2:172–73. Hebrew translation with annotations by H. Ben-Amram, *Te'ur Ge'ografi, Histori we-'Arke'ologi shel 'Eres Yisra'el* (Jerusalem, 1982) 2:123.

out that Benjamin of Tudela's (twelfth-century) reference to New Ashkelon which 'was originally called *Bnybrh*' is a scribal error for Barbara.<sup>27</sup>

Can we go back further than Benjamin of Tudela? An Egyptian inscription from the Temple of Karnak contains Seti I's (ca. 1300 B.C.E.) list of sites along the ancient military road from Sile (modern Kantarah) in the northeast corner of the Nile delta through the Sinai and into Canaan, the biblical *derekh 'eres pelishtim* (Ex. 13:17). Toward the Canaanite end of the route we find a toponym (for a fortress or watering station) the beginning of which is difficult to decipher. A. H. Gardiner read with caution '?-b(?) -r-b-t', a reading that Aḥituv seconds: '*Birbit*'.<sup>28</sup> If this reading is correct, perhaps it may be identified with the talmudic *Brbryt*. The list of sites in the inscription begins with Sile in the delta and ends at 'the settlement of *Pa-Canaan*' (literally 'that belonging to Canaan'), near which is *B(?)rbt*. Because of partial parallels between this list and an itinerary preserved in Papyrus Anastasi I, *Pa-Canaan* is customarily identified with Gaza where the Anastasi itinerary ends. If this is so, the inscription would put the Canaanite *B(?)rbt* near Gaza where no such toponym is known.<sup>29</sup> However, aside from the papyrus, there is no reason to identify *Pa-Canaan* with Gaza and therefore such identification is only 'probable, but not certain'.<sup>30</sup> If the identification is not certain, *Pa-Canaan* may perhaps extend a bit further north along *derekh 'eres pelishtim* toward Ashkelon, in which case the inscription's *B(?)rbt*, which is near *Pa-Canaan*, would be in the neighbourhood of the talmudic *Brbryt* and may perhaps be identified with it.<sup>31</sup>

(5) The Bible (Gen. 10:2–3, 1 Chr. 1:5–6) lists the descendants of Japhet, all of whom are situated in areas to the north of Israel, encompassing Asia Minor, Armenia, the Aegean, and beyond.<sup>32</sup> One of Japhet's descendants, Tog-

<sup>27</sup> In *Encyclopaedia Judaica* (Berlin, 1928–34) 3:523 and 1065. The reading *Bnybrh* is that of ed. Ferrara 1556 used by A. Asher as the base text of his edition, *The Itinerary of Benjamin of Tudela* (London, 1840), p. 43, while the manuscripts as published by M. N. Adler, *The Itinerary of Benjamin of Tudela* (London, 1907), p. 28, have *Bny Brq*. Klein notes that *Benei Beraq* near Ashkelon is an impossibility and must be a scribal error for *Bnybrh*.

<sup>28</sup> Gardiner, 'The Ancient Military Road between Egypt and Palestine', *The Journal of Egyptian Archaeology* 6 (1920), p. 114. S. Aḥituv, *Canaanite Toponyms in Ancient Egyptian Documents* (Jerusalem, 1984), p. 81; but with less certainty on p. 28: '[B?]rbt'. K. A. Kitchen, however, reads [*y]m rbt*, a presumed Semitic toponym meaning 'Wide Pool' or 'Many Waters' (*Rameside Inscriptions: Translated and Annotated*, Notes and Comments volume (Oxford, 1993), p. 16, and Translation volume, p. 7), or 'The "[Se]a" (?) (of) Rabat' (*Reliefs and Inscriptions at Karnak*, edited by the Epigraphic Survey, vol. 4: *The Battle Reliefs of King Seti I* (Chicago, 1986), pp. 11–12, pl. 4, no. 15), a reading adopted by J. E. Hoch, *Semitic Words in Egyptian Texts of the New Kingdom and Third Intermediate Period* (Princeton, 1994), nos. 52 and 277.

<sup>29</sup> J. A. Wilson in J. B. Pritchard, *Ancient Near Eastern Texts* (3rd. ed., Princeton, 1969), p. 254c: 'the town of Canaan which we cannot locate'. *Reliefs and Inscriptions at Karnak*, vol. 4: *The Battle Reliefs of King Seti I*, pp. 11–12, pl. 4, no. 15: '*R-b3-ti*, an unknown locality in northern Sinai'.

<sup>30</sup> Kitchen, *Rameside Inscriptions*, Notes and Comments volume, pp. 14–15.

<sup>31</sup> On the lack of a second *r*, see the discussion below at n. 47.

<sup>32</sup> For the identifications and locations, see the various Bible commentaries, e.g. E. Speiser, *Anchor Bible Genesis* (Garden City NY, 1964), pp. 65–66; C. Westermann, *Genesis 1–11: A Commentary*, transl. J. J. Scullion (Minneapolis, 1984; German ed. 1974), pp. 504–506; U. Cassuto, *A Commentary on the Book of Genesis*, transl. I. Abrahams (Jerusalem, 1964; Hebrew ed. 1947),



armah, which the prophet Ezekiel (38:6 '*Bet Togarmah*') locates in 'the remotest parts of the north (*yarkete safon*)', has been identified by biblical scholars as the cuneiform Tilgarimmu (Akkadian) or Tegarama (Hittite) situated in east Anatolia, near the valley of the upper Euphrates.<sup>33</sup> Now in a paraphrase of Gen. 10:3 and 1 Chr. 1:6 some Palestinian Targums report that 'the province (*hyprkyh*) of Togarmah is Barbaria'.<sup>34</sup> Similarly, the Christian Syriac *Cave of Treasures* 24.17 lists 'Barbares' among the descendants of Japhet.<sup>35</sup>

2:190–92; G. J. Wenham, *Genesis 1–15* in the Word Biblical Commentary series (Waco TX, 1987), pp. 216–18. Also: S. Loewenstamm in *Ensiqlopedya Miqra'it (Encyclopaedia Biblica)* (Jerusalem, 1950–82), s.vv. *bene yefet* (3:746 f) and the individual names; *Anchor Bible Dictionary* (New York, 1992), s.vv. 'Japheth' (3:642) and individual names; I. M. Diakonoff, 'The Naval Power and Trade of Tyre', *IEJ* 42 (1992), p. 174 n. 29; S. J. Bastomsky, 'Noah, Italy, and the Sea-Peoples', *JQR* 67 (1976–77), pp. 150–51; D. Neiman, 'The Two Genealogies of Japhet', in *Orient and Occident: Festschrift Cyrus Gordon* (AOAT 22), ed. H. A. Hoffner (Neukirchen-Vluyn, 1973), p. 121; W. Horowitz, 'The Isles of the Nations: Genesis X and Babylonian Geography', in *Studies in the Pentateuch*, ed. J. A. Emerton (Leiden, 1990), pp. 38–39. For the late-antique Jewish identification of the individual biblical names, see C. T. R. Hayward, *Saint Jerome's 'Hebrew Questions on Genesis'* (Oxford, 1995), pp. 138–39 with cited literature, and see also F. Petit (ed.), *La Chaîne sur la Genèse: édition intégrale* (Louvain, 1993), 2:806–08.

<sup>33</sup> See references in previous note. The city Togarmah is usually identified as modern-day Gürün (= classical Gauræna) in Turkey; see e.g. N. Naaman, *Ensiqlopedya Miqra'it* 8:430–31, and D. W. Baker, *Anchor Bible Dictionary* 6:594–95. See also I. M. Diakonoff, 'The Naval Power and Trade of Tyre', *IEJ* 42 (1992), p. 178 n. 48. J. D. Hawkins, however, thinks 'it is probably best placed in the plain of Elbistan rather than at Gürün' ('The Political Geography of North Syria and South-East Anatolia in the Neo-Assyrian Period', *Neo-Assyrian Geography*, ed. M. Liverani (Rome, 1995), p. 90).

<sup>34</sup> Genesis: Targum Neofiti, Neofiti margin, the Vatican and Yemenite 'fragment targums'. The Palestinian targums to the Pentateuch have been conveniently published in a synoptic edition by A. Diez Macho (*et al.*): *Targum Palaestinense in Pentateuchem (Biblia Polyglotta Matritensia)* (Madrid, 1977). For Chronicles, there are three extant manuscripts and no independent printed edition. R. Le Déaut and J. Robert, *Targum des Chroniques (cod. vat. urb. 1)* (Rome, 1971), provide an edition with critical apparatus. A. Sperber's earlier edition (*The Bible in Aramaic* (Leiden, 1968), vol 4a) is based on one of the manuscripts. In the new English translation of targumic literature, with critical introductions (eds. K. Cathcart, M. Maher and M. McNamara, *The Aramaic Bible: The Targums*), volume 1A (1992) contains Targum Neofiti (transl. M. McNamara) to Genesis, and vol. 19 the Targum to Chronicles (transl. S. McIvor). The dating of the targumic literature is much debated. There seems to be a growing consensus that the redaction of the Palestinian Targums occurred in the Islamic period, although some have argued for an earlier date (not later than the fourth or fifth century). More important for our study, however, is the date of the underlying tradition used (if such be the case) by the Targum. In this regard, the words of A. D. York are relevant: 'No effective method has as yet been devised to distinguish between the recension of a particular targumic text and the tradition that underlies that text' ('The Dating of Targumic Literature', *JSJ* 5 (1974), p. 49). York is talking of a general method applicable across the board. It is possible, however, at times to date individual traditions. M. Goshen-Gottstein thinks that the toponyms listed in the Palestinian targumim to these verses (Gen. 10:2–4) reflect the geo-political situation of the third to fourth century Roman Empire (*Sheqi'im mi-Targume ha-Miqra' ha-'Aramiyim (Fragments of Lost Targumim)* (Ramat-Gan, 1989) 2:102). According to McIvor, the basis of Targ. Chr. dates from the fourth century or earlier, and the final redaction from perhaps the eighth century; provenance is generally considered to be Palestine (pp. 16–18). The term used in the Targum (*hyprkyh* = *ἵπραρχία*) has been found in a document recovered from the Judaean desert, see Ada Yardeni, '*Nahal Şe'elim*' Documents (Jerusalem, 1995), p. 67. The Rabbinic sources are at *yMeg* 1.11, 71b; *bYoma* 10a; *GenR* 37.1.

<sup>35</sup> Ed. Su-Min Ri, *La Caverne des trésors*. CSCO 486–87, *Scriptores Syri* 207–08 (Louvain, 1987), pp. 190–91 (text), 72–73 (translation). The Cave of Treasures is dated to the sixth century in its present form although it was originally composed in the fourth, or possibly the third, cen-

A. Knobel understood the targumic *Barbaria* to be a common noun 'welche indess auch zu den von mancherlei Barbaren bewohnten Ländern am schwarzen und kaspischen Meere passt'.<sup>36</sup> Goshen-Gottstein, realizing that a proper noun better fits the context, identified *Barbaria* with *Barbary* in North Africa but was forced to admit the equivocal nature of such identification.<sup>37</sup> After all, *Barbary* is not generally considered to be one of the northern territories of Japhet. On the other hand, J. Schwarz conjectured 150 years ago that the Targums' *Barbaria* might be related to a Mesopotamian place of similar name, near biblical *Resen*, although he did not know of any such place.<sup>38</sup>

On the face of it, an attractive identification with the targumic *Barbaria* would be the cuneiform **Bit Barbari** (or **Pit Parpāri**) mentioned in an Assyrian text from the reign of Sargon II (721–705 B.C.E.) and in an Elamite text from the reign of Šišak-Inšušinak (ca. 1150–1120 B.C.E.).<sup>39</sup> However, Parpola locates the Assyrian **Bit Barbari** in Media, and the Elamite text indicates a location outside Mesopotamia, in the modern Holwan region, east of the Tigris and west of the Zagros Mountains.<sup>40</sup> Thus despite the close linguistic parallel (*Bet Togramah*, *Bit Barbari*), the location of the cuneiform placename in or near Media would rule out an identification with the descendants of Japhet to the north of Israel, and it would certainly rule out an identification with *Togarmah* / *Tilgarimmu* / *Tegarama* in the upper Euphrates area.<sup>41</sup>

Another possibility is the **Barbarian Plain** (πεδῖον) mentioned by Procopius (sixth century), *Bell. Pers.* 2.5.29, as being south of *Sura* and west of the Euphrates, in which the city of *Sergiopolis* was situated.<sup>42</sup> M. A. Kugener has

---

tury; see Ri, pp. xxii–xxiii. Note, incidentally, the line 'In the 60th year of Isaac, the king of the Barbarians, Azbael, built a city and named it Azbul' which occurs only in the Georgian version of the *Cave of Treasures* 31.7, ed. C. Kourcikidzé, p. 80; transl. J.-P. Mahé, p. 55: *La Caverne des trésors: version Géorgienne*. CSCO 526–27, *Scriptores Iberici* 23–24 (Louvain, 1992–93).

<sup>36</sup> *Die Völkertafel der Genesis: Ethnographische Untersuchungen* (Giessen, 1850), p. 58.

<sup>37</sup> *Sheqi'im* 2:101; see also p. 102, n. 12.

<sup>38</sup> *Tevu'ot ha-'Ares* (3rd ed., Jerusalem, 1900; originally published Jerusalem 1845), p. 287.

<sup>39</sup> W. Hinz and H. Koch, *Elamisches Wörterbuch* (Berlin, 1987– ) 1:198, s.v. *bi-it ba-ar-ba-ri*; G. G. Cameron, *History of Early Iran* (Chicago, 1936), pp. 116–17; *RLA* 2:45, s.v. *Bit Ištar* (F. W. König); *RGTC* 11:44.

<sup>40</sup> S. Parpola, *New Assyrian Toponyms* (Kevelaer, 1970), p. 78. F. W. König, *Die elamischen Königsinschriften* (Archiv für Orientforschung, Beiheft 16), 54.52 = p. 129; cf. 54.32 'Ša Barbari'; Cameron, *ad loc.*; Hinz and Koch, *ad loc.*: 'aus dem Mesopotamien'. It is possible that the two texts refer to the same place (see *RLA*, *RGTC*). Similarly, as suggested by Paul Rost (who reads *bit* for *luh*), a **Parbara** mentioned by Ptolemy (6.5.2) as being situated in Parthia, may possibly be identified with one or both of the **Bit Barbaris** (*Untersuchungen zu aliorientalischen Geschichte, Mitteilungen der Vorderasiatischen Gesellschaft* 1897 2/2, p. 114). See also M. Streck, 'Das Gebiet der heutigen Landschaften Armenien, Kurdistan und Westpersien nach den babylonisch-assyrischen Keilinschriften', *ZA* 15 (1900), pp. 357–58. Ptolemy is in the Wilberg/Grashof edition, p. 400, line 14. If the personal name *Barbiri* found in an Assyrian text (see Knut L. Tallqvist, *Assyrian Personal Names* (Helsingfors, 1914), p. 52b; see also 276a, **Birbirum**) is derived from the person's land of origin, the name would supply further indication of a toponym *Barbari* or *Barbiri*. Cf. the listing **Barwawa** in *RGTC* 4:25 based on the personal name *Barwawaša*. For the possibility that the Latin personal name *Barbarus* is similarly derived from a toponym, see above at n. 19.

<sup>41</sup> Similarly, rule out **Barbatia**, mentioned by Pliny, *NH* 6.32.146, apparently on the lower Tigris. On the lack of the second *r*, see below at n. 47.

<sup>42</sup> See Benzinger, *RE* 2:2858; Ritter, pp. 1087 and 1090; and Ramsay, p. 357.

noted that Severus, monophysite patriarch of Antioch, in a homily dated in the year 514, refers to the *barberāye* of that area, and he thus concludes that the inhabitants of the Barbarian Plain were called *barberāye* after the name of the plain. He finds support for this conclusion in another sixth-century text, the *Life of Aḥudemmeḥ*, which often refers to the nomadic Arabs of Mesopotamia as 'Barbares'.<sup>43</sup>

The Barbarian Plain is certainly a possible candidate for identification with the targumic Barbaria. But, in truth, Barbaria toponyms are found all over Mesopotamia of antiquity and late antiquity. A fourteenth-century B.C.E. cuneiform text mentions a Hittite city **Barbarra** (or **Parparra**) near Almina at the border of Kaskaean territory, i.e. in Eastern Anatolia.<sup>44</sup> The *Tabula Peutinger* X.4 (fourth–fifth century) lists a **Barbare** located east of Edessa on the Edessa–Nisibis route.<sup>45</sup> Also in Northern Mesopotamia are **Babarura** and **Babburi**, place-names known from the Assyrian period, ca. ninth century B.C.E., located in Assyria or in Niari territory, in the upper Tigris area.<sup>46</sup> Although there is no extant variant of these latter names with *r* between the two *b*s, they should not be ruled out as possible representatives of Barbar-toponyms, for we commonly find variants of such names elsewhere with and without *r*, e.g. *Bbr* / *Brbr* (in the Demotic text mentioned in note 1 above), and Barbares / Bavares / Babari and Barbari / Barbiti in Mauretania (discussed above, II.3).<sup>47</sup> Also in Japhetic territory, in Dacia Mediterranea—north of Macedonia, west of Thrace—near Bugaraka, is a fort by the name of **Barbaries** mentioned by Procopius, *De aedificiis* 4.4.3.<sup>48</sup>

Finally, we ought to consider **Barbara** (var. **Parpara**, **Barpara**) in Assyria near the border with Arrapḥe (modern Kirkuk).<sup>49</sup> To be sure, Ezekiel locates Togarmah in 'the remotest parts of the north (*yarkete ṣafon*)', and Barbara / Parpara is in Middle Mesopotamia not as far north as Togarmah, but we cannot assume that the targumic tradition, or its source, had detailed geographic knowledge of the Mesopotamian area. For the same reason we should not rule out toponyms in Syria such as **Barraba'u**, mentioned in an Eblaite text from the third millennium B.C.E., and identified as being north of Ebla,

<sup>43</sup> *Oriens Christianus* 1907, pp. 408–12.

<sup>44</sup> *RGTC* 6:306, *RLA* 1:399 (E. Forrer).

<sup>45</sup> According to K. Miller, *Itin. Rom.* 777, the *Tabula's* *Barbare* is to be identified with **Bara Beta** (i.e. **Barabeta**), mentioned in the *Ravenna Cosmography* 2.13.46 (PP 79.10–11), ed. J. Schnetz, *Itineraria Romana*, vol. 2 (Leipzig, 1940), p. 24. See Baumgartner, *RE* 2:2851, s.v. *Bara* 1.

<sup>46</sup> *RLA* 1:329 (Ebeling); M. Streck in *ZA* 13 (1898), p. 65; R. P. Boudon, 'Liste de Noms géographiques', *Orientalia* 36–38 (Rome, 1929), p. 30.

<sup>47</sup> Cf. also *Barbare* / *Barabeta* mentioned above in n. 45 and possibly *B(?)rbl* / *Brbryt* in Canaan (above, II.4).

<sup>48</sup> Tomaschek, *RE* 2:2857–58. H. B. Dewing (LCL, p. 259): in the district of Cabetzuz. Cf. the river **Barbana** in Illyria, *Livy* 44.31.3, shown in H. Kiepert, *Atlas Antiquus*, V Ba.

<sup>49</sup> *RGTC* 10:218–19 (ca. 1500 or 1400 B.C.E.); A. Fadhil, *Studien zur Topographie und Prosopographie der Provinzstädte des Königreichs Arrapḥe* (Mainz, 1983), pp. 97a, 198a–b (on the right bank of the Lower Zab and east of the Tigris). Possibly to be identified with the Middle Assyrian **Parparra** found in the *nisbe* *Parparraju*. K. Deller and J. N. Postgate in *Archiv für Orientforschung* 32 (1985), pp. 73b–74a; *RGTC* 5:216. Is this location(s) to be identified with the Elamite and/or Median Bit-Barbari?

i.e. near modern Aleppo,<sup>50</sup> or the very well known city of **Barbarissos** (modern Balis) on the left bank of the Euphrates in the area of Chalybonitis on the Aleppo–Sura route.<sup>51</sup> It should lastly be noted that the Targums may have had more than one of the northern ‘Barbaria’ toponyms in mind, which they may or may not have distinguished. In sum, then, we are not in a position to identify the Targums’ Barbaria in northern Japhetic territory because we do not know the parameters of the Targums’ geographic knowledge and because there are too many toponyms answering to the name. We can say with certainty, however, that a specific place in the north was intended; the Targums were not using the term as a common noun. Nor was the reference to Barbary in North Africa.

(6) As with the Targum, so too a text found in a medieval compilation, *Pirqe Mashiah*, points to a northern location: ‘I will gather all the nations to war against Jerusalem, and they are Gomer, its branches Togarmah, Phrygia, Garamit, Garmamah, Cappadocia, Barbari, Italy . . .’<sup>52</sup> ‘Barbari’ is grouped with the descendants of Gomer son of Japhet, and can thus be situated in the north.

(7) A tannaitic commentary to Deut. 32:21, in which God says of Israel: ‘I will rouse them to jealousy with a people of no account [lit. ‘a no-people’, *be-lo’ am*], I will vex them with a nation of fools [*nabal*]’, states:

‘And I will rouse them to jealousy with a *be-lo’ am*.’ Do not read *bl’ m*, but *blwy m*, this refers to those who come from among the nations and kingdoms and expel them [the Jews] from their homes. Another interpretation: This refers to those who come from *barbaria* and *mrṭny*’ (= Mauretania), who go about

<sup>50</sup> *RGTC* 12/1:76. On the lack of the first *r*, see above at n. 47. In another Eblaite text we find **Birbirranu** (*RGTC* 12/1:79). Cf. **Birraru** and **Bub(u)ru** (*ibid.*).

<sup>51</sup> Ptolemy 5.14.13, *Itinerarium Theodosii* 32 (ca. 530, CSEL 39:125 ‘De situ terrae sanctae’), variant spelling for the more usual **Barbalissos** (**Barbalissus**). The common spelling with *l* is found in: *Tab. Peut.* X.2 (p. 759); *Itin. Ant.* 188; Steph. Byz., s.v.; *Notitia Dignitatum Or.* (ca. 400 C.E.) 33.3 and 33.25; *Anon. Rav.* 2.5.31, (PP 54.8) and 2.15.40 (PP 88.13); Procopius, *Bell. Pers.* 2.12.4; *De aed.* 2.9.10. Benzinger, *RE* 2:2854–55; *TLL* 1728; Ritter, pp. 1000, 1065–70; R. Dussaud, *Topographie historique de la Syrie antique et médiévale* (Paris, 1927), pp. 452–53, map xiv, facing p. 472; Ramsay, p. 357; Calderini, *Dizionario* 2:32. Müller-Fischer, p. 975; Hammond, 27 Ed. Cf. **Barblana**, *Anon. Rav.* 2.5.22 (53.10). Malalas’s (*Chronicle* 18.462) **Barbaissos** is a scribal error. Lastly, note further south in Lebanon **Barbāra**, near Jabīl, ancient Byblos (S. Wild, *Libanesische Ortsnamen* (Beirut, 1973), p. 132).

<sup>52</sup> The text was first published in a collection of midrashim in Salonika, 1743, from which Jellinek reproduced it in his *Bet ha-Midrash* (Leipzig, 1855), 3:72. From Jellinek it appeared in J. D. Eisenstein, *Oṣar ha-Midrashim* (New York, 1915), 2:393a. Years later Yehuda Even-Shemuel in *Midreshe Ge’ulah* (2nd ed., Jerusalem, 1954), p. 337, reproduced the same text adding variants from a Jerusalem manuscript. (Even-Shemuel has the date of 1813 for the Salonika imprint but Y. Vinograd, *Oṣar ha-Sefer ha-’Ivri* (Thesaurus of the Hebrew Book) (Jerusalem, 1993), 2:671, indicates Jellinek’s date to be the correct one.) For my translation ‘Phrygia’ for the text’s *’fryqy*, see Hayward, *Saint Jerome’s ‘Hebrew Questions on Genesis’*, pp. 138–39 with cited literature in n. 2, the MS variant *’fryqy*’ listed by Even-Shemuel (p. 443), and Rapoport, *Erekh Millin*, 1:361–62. Jellinek thinks that the source for this passage was Josippon. However, the manuscripts of Josippon in listing the descendants of Japhet do not have Barbari, nor do they otherwise correspond to the text of *Pirqe Mashiah*; see D. Flusser’s edition, *The Josippon (Josephus Gorionides)* (Jerusalem 1980), 1:3 ff. In discussing the sources of the text, Even-Shemuel (p. 301) does not mention Josippon.

naked in the market place.<sup>53</sup>

The parallel with Mauretania would seem to indicate a location for Barbaria in Africa, but where? There is an abundance of evidence—Egyptian, classical, Jewish, Christian, Arabic and even Chinese—attesting to the toponym Barbaria in what is today Sudan and Somalia.

Egyptian inscriptions going back to the fifteenth century B.C.E. refer to a *brbrt*, which is located either in the area of Sudan (along the Atbara River or where the Atbara meets the Nile) or Somalia.<sup>54</sup> The *Periplus Maris Erythraei* (first century C.E.) and Ptolemy (second century C.E.) call areas in Sudan and Somalia 'Barbaria' and 'the country of the Barbarians'. Cosmas Indicopleustes (sixth century C.E.) several times identifies Barbaria with the area of Somalia, putting it at the borders of Ethiopia, i.e. the same location reported in the *Periplus*. Stephanus Byzantinus' (sixth century) reference to Barbaria being near the Arabian Gulf probably indicates the same place and is similar to Cosmas' description of 'Barbaria beyond the Arabian Gulf', since 'Arabian Gulf' commonly refers to all the sea between and including the Persian Gulf and the Red Sea. The Christian Syriac writer Isho'dad of Merv (ninth century) puts Ethiopia, Egypt and Barbaria (*brbr*) in the same general vicinity.<sup>55</sup> So does Eutychius (= Sa'īd ibn Bitrīq), Alexandrian Melkite patriarch

<sup>53</sup> Sifre Deuteronomy 320 (ed. Finkelstein, p. 367), *bYev* 63b, *Midrash Tannaim*, ad loc. (ed. Hoffman, p. 196), *Leqah Tov*, ad loc. (ed. Buber, p. 115). *Midrash Tannaim* adds to the text: 'Another interpretation: I will rouse them to jealousy with a people of no account—these are the *kuthim*.' *bYev* bases the interpretation on different words ('a foolish nation') of the same verse. The redaction of *Sifre Deuteronomy* is generally put in the early Amoraic period (230–280); see the discussion in S. Fraade, 'Sifre Deuteronomy 26 (ad Deut. 3:23): How Conscious the Composition?', *HUCA* 54 (1983), pp. 296–98, and add: Fraade, *From Tradition to Commentary* (Albany, 1991), pp. 17 and 185 n. 56; Reuven Hammer, *Sifre: A Tannaitic Commentary on the Book of Deuteronomy* (New Haven, 1986), p. 8 (both mid-third century); and S. Lieberman 'Palestine in the Third and Fourth Centuries', *Jewish Quarterly Review* 36 (1946), p. 355 (beginning of the third century). Among those who opt for a later dating (Fraade in *HUCA*), add D. Boyarin, who, speaking of tannaitic midrashim in general, considers the redaction to have been done in 'probably the late third and fourth centuries' ('On the Status of the Tannaitic Midrashim', *JAOS* 112 (1992), p. 460). The question of redaction is separate from the dating of Sifre's contents, which, by and large, stem from the tannaitic period.

<sup>54</sup> Karola Zibelius, *Afrikanische Orts- und Völkernamen in hieroglyphischen und hieratischen Texten* (Wiesbaden, 1972), p. 107, s.v. H. Gauthier, *Dictionnaire des noms géographiques contenus dans les textes hiéroglyphiques* (Cairo, 1925–31), 2: 23–24, s.vv. *brbr* and *brbrta*. The texts are now found in *Reliefs and Inscriptions at Karnak*, vol. 4 (above, n. 28), p. 53, pl. 15, no. 9, and p. 62, p. 17, no. 8.

<sup>55</sup> *Periplus* 2–7, 12, 17, 25 (ed. Casson, pp. 50–57, 64–65; ed. Huntingford, pp. 19–23, 34, and see p. 83). The author distinguishes between the two Barbarias, calling the area in Sudan along the Red Sea and stretching south from Berenice 'the land of Barbaria' (ἡ Βαρβαρικὴ χώρα) or 'the land of the Barbaroi', and the area in Somalia 'another Barbaria' (ἄλλη Βαρβαρία). On the dating of the *Periplus* see Casson, pp. 6–7. Ptolemy 1.17.5, 4.7.4 and 10; ed. Müller-Fischer, pp. 46, 767, 780; Wilburg-Grashof, pp. 57, 299–307. W. Wolska-Conus, *Cosmas Indicopleustes: Topographie Chrétienne* (SC 141, 159, 197. Paris, 1968), 1:328–29 (Cosmas 2.26), provides a listing of Cosmas's references and discussion; see also the scholia and variant readings on 2:376–77 (to Cosmas 2.61–63); on the scholia, 1:76–79. And note the comment of E. O. Winstedt, *The Christian Topography of Cosmas Indicopleustes* (Cambridge, 1909), pp. 333–34. In the English translation of J. W. McCrindle, *The Christian Topography of Cosmas, an Egyptian Monk* (New York, 1967; originally published by the Hakluyt Society), see Index, s.v. On Cosmas, Olshausen, pp. 71–72. The *Periplus*, Ptolemy, and Cosmas are excerpted in G. S. P. Freeman-Grenville, *The*

(d. 940), who lists among the descendants of Ham, 'the Egyptians, the Sūdān, the Abyssinians (Ḥabash), the Nūbians, and (it is said) the Barbari'.<sup>56</sup> The personal name Barbari bar Dargi found in an Aramaic papyrus from Elephantine, dated 447 B.C.E., may indicate the geographic name of the area in Sudan referred to by these sources.<sup>57</sup> The East African locations persist in Christian sources into the sixteenth century and beyond as indicated by Portuguese reports of East Africa. Tomé Pires in 1512–15 and Francisco Rodrigues before 1515 refer to the Somali port of Berbera (Barbora) as a major trading center on the coast, and Marmol Carvajal's (sixteenth century) 'city of Barbara' was situated in lower Ethiopia.<sup>58</sup> The name is similarly found in

*East African Coast* (London, 1962), pp. 1–7. *Stephanus Byzantinus Ethniconum*, ed. A. Meineke (Berlin, 1849, p. 158, s.v. Isho'dad, is in *Commentaire d'Iso'dad de Merv sur l'Ancien Testament*. Genèse: Text, ed. J.-M. Vosté and C. Van Den Eynde. CSCO 126, Scriptorum Syri 67 (Louvain, 1950), p. 58; translation, C. Van Den Eynde. CSCO 156, Scriptorum Syri 75 (Louvain, 1955), p. 63. Lastly, see also Tomaschek in *RE* 2:2855–56, and Calderini, *Dizionario* 2:32.

Note Casson's remark on p. 244 where he now translates Pliny's (21.29; following Desange) *baccar* ... *barbaricam* and Galen's (*De antidotis* 2.13; ed. C. G. Kühn (Leipzig, 1827; repr. Hildesheim, 1965), 14:64) reference to cinnamon *ἐκ τῆς βαρβαρίου* as indicating geographic areas (i.e. Barbaria or the land of the Barbaroi) rather than 'barbarian' or 'exotic'. Similarly, Desange thinks that *negotii barbaricis* in the fourth-century *Expositio totius mundi et gentium* 35 (ed. Riese, p. 113; ed. Rougé, pp. 170–71) does not mean 'barbarian' but has a precise geographic meaning, the Somali coast ('L'Afrique noire et le monde méditerranéen dans l'Antiquité Ethiopiens et Gréco-Romains', *Revue française d'histoire d'outre-mer* 62 (1975), p. 407, n. 92). May we say the same now for *βαρβαρίκιον* which is apparently a type of clothing mentioned in P. Oxyrhynchus 1684, lines 5 and 9 (B. P. Grenfell and A. S. Hunt, *The Oxyrhynchus Papyri* (London, 1898), 14:146; dated to the late fourth century C.E.)? These 'Barbarian' clothing references receive support from the Coptic textile term *βαρβαρικάριος* 'manufacturer of brocade' (Ewa Wipszycka in *The Coptic Encyclopedia* 7:2221). On the possibility that Origen meant the toponym in *Hom. in Num.* 1.3 'aegyptios gerimus et barbaros mores' (GCS 30 (Origen 7): 4; SC 415, pp. 34–35), see my 'Scythian-Barbarian: The Permutations of a Classical Topos in Jewish and Christian Texts of Late Antiquity', Appendix I, *Journal of Jewish Studies* 49 (1998), pp. 98–99.

<sup>56</sup> L. Cheikho (ed.), *Eutykhii patriarchae Alexandrini: Annales* (Beirut, 1906), CSCO 50, Scriptorum Arabici 6 (= MS Beirut ar. 1), p. 14, lines 19–21. Pococke's Latin translation (1658–59) of the *Annales* published in *PG* 111.917B (sec. 41–43) has: 'the Egyptians, the Nigritae, the Ethiopians and (it is said) the Barbari'. Pococke's translation was based on three seventeenth-century Arabic MSS. The readings of the various manuscripts is found in M. Breydy, *Études sur Sa'id ibn Batriq et ses sources*. CSCO 450, Subsidia 69 (Louvain, 1983), p. 118, lines 14–17.

<sup>57</sup> So H. Ingholt, 'Varia Tadmorea', in *Palmyre: bilan et perspectives*, pp. 111–12. P. Grelot, on the other hand, believes that the name derives from the Iranian geographic area, as indicated by the father's name (whether one reads *drgy* or *ddgy*) and title (*kspy* = Caspian). He notes that the personal name Barbiri is found in an Assyrian text and it would therefore not be surprising to find someone from the Iranian area with the name ('Notes d'onomastique sur les textes araméens d'égypte', *Semitica* 21 (1971), p. 107). For the Assyrian text, see above, n. 40. The Aramaic text was first published by A. Cowley, *Aramaic Papyri of the Fifth Century B.C.* (Oxford, 1923), pp. 37–38, line 19, and is now found also in B. Porten and A. Yardeni, *Textbook of Aramaic Documents from Ancient Egypt* (Jerusalem, 1989) 2:34–35.

<sup>58</sup> Tomé Pires and Francisco Rodrigues are in the Hakluyt series, *The Suma Oriental of Tomé Pires and The Book of Francisco Rodrigues*, ed. and transl. A. Cortesão (London, 1944), Index, s.v. 'Berbera (Barbora)'. Pires is partially quoted by Freeman-Grenville, *The East African Coast*, pp. 125–26. Luis del Marmol Carvajal, *Descripción General de Africa*, Part I (Granada, 1573), fol. 15, cited by Paulo Fernando de Moraes Farias, 'Models of the World and Categorical Models: The "Enslavable Barbarian" as a Mobile Classificatory Label', in J. R. Willis (ed.), *Slaves and Slavery in Muslim Africa* (London, 1985), 1:38. See also A. Z. Aescoly, *Sippur David ha-Re'uveni* (2nd ed., Jerusalem, 1993), p. 19 (Hebrew enumeration). A discussion of the geographical identity of Barbaria as the area of the Somali coast is found in I. Opelt and W. Speyer in *Jahrbuch für*

Ethiopic sources from the end of the seventeenth and beginning of the eighteenth centuries.<sup>59</sup>

Barbaria as a place in East Africa is well known to Arabic sources. 'The older Arab geographers write of the land of Berberā, the Gulf of 'Aden being *Bahr Berberā* or *al-Khalij al-Berberī*. The inhabitants are known as *barbaroi*, Berbera, or Berābir. They are Somali and the people whom Yāqūt (4.602) describes as barbarous negroes.'<sup>60</sup> Similarly, among Arab writers one finds a connection between *zanj* (East Africa, south of Ethiopia), *barbarā*, *aḥābish* (Abbyssinia) and, sometimes, other black African peoples. Ibn Sa'īd (d. 1286/87) says that 'near the Zanj is a village of the Barbarā, which Imru' al-Qais [a pre-Islamic Arabic poet] mentioned in his poetry'.<sup>61</sup> Ibn Qutayba (d. 889), in the name of Wahb ibn Munabbih (d. ca. 730), also includes the Barbarā with the Zanj and other East African people: 'The descendants of Kush and Canaan are the races of the blacks (*sūdān*): the Nubians, the Zanj, the Qaran (or Qazan), the Zaghawa, the Ḥabasha, the Copts (*qibṭ*) and the Barbar.'<sup>62</sup> In this regard, note al-Kirmānī's (d. 1021) grouping of the Zanj and

---

*Antike und Christentum* 10 (1967), p. 284. Note the letter of a Christian missionary in Cairo written in 1742 which refers to a 'Berberine' servant from the kingdom of Nubia (W. Y. Adams, *Nubia: Corridor to Africa* (Princeton, 1977), p. 543). The name is still used (*RE* 2:2855–56). The name 'Barbaria' for this part of Africa is so well known that we may see a subtle reference to the location in the lines from the Pseudo-Shakespearean play *The Lamentable Tragedy of Lochrine* (written between 1585 and 1594): 'If all the brave nation of the Troglodites, / If all the coal-black Aethiopians, / If all the forces of the Amazons, / If all the hosts of the barbarian lands, / Should dare to enter this our little world [= Britain] . . .' (4.2.30–34; ed. J. L. Gooch, (New York, 1981), p. 105), despite the fact that the adjective 'barbarous' is elsewhere (1.2.110, 2.2.6, 3.2.44, 4.2.6, 5.6.69) used by the author to describe other lands.

<sup>59</sup> G. W. B. Huntingford, *The Historical Geography of Ethiopia*, ed. R. Pankhurst (Oxford, 1989), pp. 221, 231.

<sup>60</sup> I. Lewis, *EI*<sup>2</sup> 1:1172–73, s.v. Berberā; see also P. M. Holt, s.vv. Barābra and Berber (Barbar) for Arabic sources mentioning territory and people of these names found along the Nile (1:1028–29, 1171–72); and Paulo Fernando de Moraes Farias, 'Models of the World and Categorical Models', pp. 37–38. (With Farias's comments compare J. O. Hunwick's about the Zanj of the *Ta'rīkh al-Fāttāsh* chronicle (basically sixteenth to seventeenth centuries) who are a servile caste living near the Niger; 'The Term "Zanj" and its Derivatives in a West African Chronicle', in D. Dalby (ed.), *Language and History in Africa* (London, 1970), p. 102–08.) Note also V. Minorsky's comment in his edition of the *Hudūd al-'Ālam* (London, 1970), p. 179. Lastly, see T. Papadopoulos, *Afrocanobyzantina: Byzantine Influences on Negro-Sudanese Cultures* (Athens, 1966), pp. 83–85, who cites the Mandara Chronicle's mention of a Land of the Barbar between Arabia and Africa. According to Papadopoulos, this Chronicle records information from pre-Islamic Sudan. Several examples of 'Berbera' and 'Berberes' in Arab sources may be found in G. Ferrand, *Relations de voyages et textes géographiques arabes, persans et turks relatifs à l'extrême-orient du VIIIe au XVIIIe siècles* (Paris, 1913), Index. See also J. M. Couq, *Recueil des sources arabes concernant l'Afrique occidentale du VIIIe au XVIe siècle (bilād al-Sūdān)* (Paris, 1975), pp. 244 and 252, who quotes East African references to Barbara / Berbera in Dimashqī (d. 1327) and in the *Suwār al-Aqālīm* (fourteenth century).

<sup>61</sup> In Ibn Khaldūn, *Kitāb al-'Ibar* (ed. 1956), 6:410 (translation by de Slane, *Histoire des Berbères* (Paris, 1934–56), 2:105 ff, excerpted in J. M. Couq, *Recueil*, p. 340).

<sup>62</sup> Ibn Qutayba, *Kitāb al-Ma'ārif*, ed. Tharwat 'Ukāsha (Cairo, 1960), p. 26; ed. F. Wüstenfeld, *Ibn Coteibas Handbuch der Geschichte* (Göttingen, 1850), p. 14. English translations of the passage: Bernard Lewis, *Race and Slavery*, pp. 124–25, and *Islam from the Prophet Muhammad to the Capture of Constantinople* (New York, 1974), 2:210; Levtzion and Hopkins, *Corpus of Early Arabic Sources*, p. 15. On a reading 'Qazan' (possibly for 'Fazzan') instead of 'Qaran', see Levtzion and Hopkins, p. 376 n. 1.

*Brbr*.<sup>63</sup> Discussing several Arabic writers, before and including Masūdī (d. 956), J. Wansbrough concludes that 'there appears to be a connection between *zanj*, *barbarā*, ... and *aḥābīsh*, which could be set out as follows: *barbarā* are a subdivision of *zanj*, who in turn belong to *aḥābīsh*'.<sup>64</sup> Ibn Baṭṭūta (d. 1377) refers to an area on the east coast of Africa by the name of Berbera, of which Zeila is the capital.<sup>65</sup> Al-Muqaddasī's (d. 988) categorization of slaves (*khadam*) includes the Barbar, who are brought to Aden. As Couq notes, the reference is to the inhabitants of Somalia.<sup>66</sup> The Persian Firdawsī (b. 940/41) in his epic, the *Shāhnāma*, refers to 'Barbaristan', which J. Darmester shows is the Somali location.<sup>67</sup> Even in modern times 'Barbare' is found in Egyptian Arabic as a synonym for Nubian.<sup>68</sup> Note too that the two areas of Barbaria in East Africa persist in the names of the modern Barbar (Berber) in Sudan above the confluence of the Atbara and the Nile and the modern Berbera on the north coast of Somalia.<sup>69</sup>

Medieval Jewish sources provide the same information. Two Judeo-Arabic documents found in the Cairo genizah refer to a Barbara that is, apparently, on the east coast of Africa. The first, a letter dated 1153 and sent from Aden to Egypt, speaks of ships arriving from India, the land of Zanj, the desert of Barbara, and Abyssinia. As noted by Eli Strauss, Barbara refers to a region in Somalia.<sup>70</sup> The second document is a record of a court case from 'Aidhāb, an African port on the Red Sea, opposite Jiddah in Saudi Arabia, equivalent to modern-day Aidip in northern Sudan. In this twelfth-century record a certain Abu Sa'īd is accused of sending away his female slave to Barbara after

<sup>63</sup> *Rāḥatu'l-'ql*, ed. M. K. Hussein and M. M. Hilmy (Cairo, 1953), p. 241.

<sup>64</sup> John Wansbrough, 'Africa and the Arab Geographers', in D. Dalby (ed.), *Language and History in Africa* (London, 1970), p. 97.

<sup>65</sup> C. Defrémery and B. R. Sanguinetti, *Les Voyages d'Ibn Batoutah* (Paris, 1854), 2:179; English translation by H. A. R. Gibb, (Ibn Baṭṭūta's) *Travels in Asia and Africa, 1325–54* (London, 1929); excerpt in Freeman-Grenville, *East African Coast*, p. 27.

<sup>66</sup> From Muqaddasī's *Aḥsan al-Taqāsīm fī Ma'rīfat al-Aqālīm* as quoted and translated by David Ayalon, 'On the Eunuchs in Islam', *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam* 1 (1979), p. 75. The passage is excerpted in Couq, *Recueil*, p. 68, who remarks that this is the earliest mention of the Barbara in Arabic sources.

<sup>67</sup> *Liber regum qui inscribitur Shahnameh*, ed. J. A. Vullers and S. Landauer (Leiden, 1877–84), p. 379 ff. English translation: M. A. and B. A. Warner, *The Shāhnāma of Firdausī* (London, 1905–06), 2:79. Darmesteter, *Etudes Iranienues* 2:222–23. The new Hebrew edition by E. Kagan and S. Shaked, *Firdausi: Shāh-nāma, The Book of Kings* (Jerusalem, 1992), p. 331, s.v., identifies Barbaristan as 'Abyssinia, Africa', but on p. 248 as a 'region in North Africa'.

<sup>68</sup> Karl Vollers, 'Beiträge zur Kenntnis der lebenden arabischer Sprache in Aegypten', *ZDMG* 51 (1897), p. 295; see also his 'Ueber Rassenfarben in der arabischen Literatur', *Centenario della nascita di Michele Amari* (Palermo, 1910), 1:94. E. A. W. Budge, *The Egyptian Sūdān* (London, 1907), passim, see Index s.v. Barābara; W. B. Emery, *Egypt in Nubia* (London, 1965), p. 16; W. Y. Adams, *Nubia: Corridor to Africa*, p. 560.

<sup>69</sup> Sites are indicated in *TAVO* A ix 5 (cf. A viii 18), B x 1, B ix 22, B ix 24, and in Grosvenor-Darley, pp. 132 E4 and 133 F7.

<sup>70</sup> *Zion* 4 (1939), p. 224. A later (sixteenth century) genizah letter also sent from Aden to Egypt refers, apparently, to the same place, 'the city whose name is Barbara, a two-days journey from Aden' (S. Asaf, 'From Egypt to Aden and India', *Zion* 4 (1939), p. 236; repr. Asaf, *Meqorot u-Meḥqarim be-Toledot Yisra'el* (Jerusalem, 1946), pp. 258–61. Cf. G. Ferrand, 'Le K'ouen-Louen et les anciennes navigations interocéaniques dans les mers du sud', *Journal Asiatique* 13 (1919), p. 477 and n. 3.



she bore his child. According to S. D. Goitein, who published the document, because Barbara was the name of a desert region in Somalia, it is used in our document in the sense of 'a desolate land'.<sup>71</sup>

Finally, two Chinese reports, one of the ninth century (the 'Yu-yang-tsu') and one written in 1226 by Chao Ju-kua, also refer to an East African country of *Pi-pa-li* or *Pi-p'a-lo*, i.e. Par-pa-ra = Barbara.<sup>72</sup>

Assuming the certain and well-attested identification of Barbaria in East Africa, I have shown elsewhere that the midrash on Deut. 32:21 is based on a wordplay of *be-lo* 'am as Blemmye, and possibly also of *nabal* as Nobae (Nubae, Nobatae, Nobadae), the two well-known East African people of antiquity, who are described as inhabiting the breadth of Africa, that is from Barbaria in the east to Mauretania in the west.<sup>73</sup> In this text, then, Barbaria refers to the location in East Africa.

(8) A group of Rabbinic statements in different midrashic contexts pair the terms *barbaria/barbari*, understood as toponyms or gentilics, with a second toponym or gentilic.<sup>74</sup> In an article dealing with these texts I demonstrated that the pairing of these terms corresponds to a topos commonly found in Greco-Roman sources. These sources use the toponyms/gentilics Scythia(n) and Ethiopia(n), the peoples at the northern and southern ends of the inhabited world, as a figure of speech to denote geographic extremes (often used as a merism) and uncivilized behaviour. The Rabbinic texts use the same topos with the same connotations, only substituting for Ethiopia(n) the other southern toponym/gentilic in East Africa, which is even further south, that is, Barbaria(n). The same figure of speech appears in Colossians 3:11 with the same sense of geographic extremes and with, it appears, the attendant connotation of racial extremes.<sup>75</sup>

(9) Eliezer, the servant of Abraham (Gen. 15:2), is considered to be a descendant of Canaan according to Rabbinic tradition. In an exegesis of Prov. 17:2 ('A servant who deals wisely . . .'), Eliezer is said to have preferred serving Abraham, since as a descendant of Canaan he was doomed to a life of slavery (Gen. 9:25) and should he leave Abraham his chances for a better master would not improve. In fact, they might considerably worsen. In the words put

<sup>71</sup> 'A Document from the African Port Aidab in the Age of the Head of the Academy Joshua b. Dosa', *Tarbiz* 21 (1950), pp. 185–91 (in Hebrew). On 'Aidhāb see *ET* 1:210. The 'Land of Barbaria' that is found in a Hebrew version of the *Alexander Romance* (W. J. van Bakkum, *A Hebrew Alexander Romance according to MS London, Jews' College, no. 145* (Leuven, 1992), pp. 58–59; I. Levi in *Qoveš 'al Yad*, o.s. 2 (1886), p. 57) and from there to Josippon, refers, according to D. Flusser, to Barbary in North Africa (*The Josippon*, 1:462).

<sup>72</sup> F. Hirth and W. W. Rockhill, *Chao Ju-kua* (St Petersburg, 1911; repr. 1966), p. 128. The later report is quoted in Freeman and Grenville, *East African Coast*, p. 21.

<sup>73</sup> 'Rabbinic Knowledge of Black Africa (Sifre Deut. 320)', forthcoming in *Jewish Studies Quarterly* (Berlin).

<sup>74</sup> *Pesiqta de-Rav Kahana* 5.7 (ed. Mandlebaum, 1:89–90) and parallels; *Midrash Psalms* 25.14, ed. S. Buber, *Midrash Tehillim* (Vilna, 1891), p. 108a; *MidPs* 109.3 in the printed editions and some MSS, see ed. Buber, p. 233a, n. 2; non-extant 'Yelammednu' to Num. 8:6 (or 3:45) quoted in Nathan b. Yehiel's 'Arukh, s.v. *smrtyn*, ed. Alexander Kohut, 'Arukh ha-Shalem 6:78a.

<sup>75</sup> 'Scythian-Barbarian: The Permutations of a Classical Topos in Jewish and Christian Texts of Late Antiquity', *Journal of Jewish Studies* 49 (1998), pp. 87–102.

in Eliezer's mouth,

'A *kushi* [= Ethiopian] or a *barbari* might enslave me! It is better for me to be a slave in this household and not in some other household.'<sup>76</sup>

The connotation of '*kushi* or *barbari*' in this context would seem to be clear. The expression, set in antithesis to Abraham, the model of piety and proper behavior, is meant to convey uncouth and uncivilized barbarism. Here too *barbari* would seem to refer to the southern toponym *Barbaria*.<sup>77</sup> As with the group of texts in II.8, Ethiopia and *Barbaria* represent the uncivilized far distant peoples. In this text, however, instead of the peoples being at the opposite ends of the world, they are found together at one end.<sup>78</sup>

In conclusion, a comparison of '*Barbaria(n)*' references in Rabbinic literature with those in other texts of antiquity and late antiquity has enabled us to apply a degree of specificity and differentiation to the references in the Rabbinic corpus, even if we cannot always locate the toponym with precision. The Ancient Near Eastern and Greco-Roman sources know of various *Barbarias* located in Anatolia, Mesopotamia, Elam / Media, Syria, Lebanon, Eastern Europe, Western Europe, Mauretania, and East Africa. The Rabbinic sources know of a *Barbaria* in the north (in Anatolia, Mesopotamia, or Syria); they

<sup>76</sup> *GenR* 60.2 (ed. Theodor-Albeck 2:640). *GenR*'s final redaction is put in the fifth century (probably the first half). A. Neubauer (*La Géographie du Talmud*, pp. 411–12, n. 7) is of the opinion that '*Barbaria*' here is the Roman Marmarica, in North Africa, with a labial *m/b* interchange. Another reference to '*kushi* or *barbari*' occurs in some variant readings of *GenR* 60.3, as listed in ed. Theodor-Albeck (2:642) and in M. Sokoloff, *The Genizah Fragments of Bereshit Rabba* (Jerusalem, 1982), p. 147. However, the fact that '*kushi* or *barbari*' appears only in some variants to *GenR* and does not appear in any manuscript or edition of *LevR* or *bTa'an*, the parallels to *GenR* 60.3, strongly indicates that the reading is not original but was copied from the immediately preceding section, *GenR* 60.2. Internal transfer of material in *GenR* is characterized by M. Kister as 'a very common phenomenon' ('Observations on Aspects of Exegesis, Tradition, and Theology in Midrash, Pseudepigrapha, and Other Jewish Writings', in *Tracing the Threads: Studies in the Vitality of Jewish Pseudepigrapha*, ed. John C. Reeves (Atlanta, 1994), p. 33, n. 85 and see n. 83). Kister is talking about transfer made at the redactional stage, while in our case it is equally possible that the transfer was made later by scribes, since the passage is missing partially or completely in different *GenR* manuscripts and citations, as well as in the parallel sources.

<sup>77</sup> As indeed recognized by S. Krauss, 'Die biblische Völkertafel im Talmud, Midrasch und Targum', *MGWJ* 39 (1895), p. 3, n. 1, except that he misunderstood the toponym as referring to Barbary in North Africa. Krauss realized that by '*kushi* or *barbari*' the midrashic text means to connote the most distant peoples of the known world, but the inhabitants of North Africa are not among them. I have dealt with this midrashic passage in greater detail in 'Scythian-Barbarian', Appendix I.

<sup>78</sup> It is possible, but not likely, that *barbari* refers to one of the northern toponyms discussed above (II.5), thus giving us the same topos found in the group of texts in II.8. However, evidence for a usage similar to *GenR* is not lacking. Origen also uses two far distant locations near to one another, Mauretania and Britain, to indicate the extreme ends of the world, in this case to the west: 'Behold the Lord's greatness. "The sound of his teaching has gone out into every land, and his words to the ends of the earth" (cf. Ps 19:4[5]). Our Lord Jesus has been spread out to the whole world . . . . The power of the Lord and Savior is with those who are in Britain, separated from our world, and with those who are in Mauretania (qui ab orbe nostro in Britannia dividuntur et . . . qui in Mauritania), and with everyone under the sun who has believed in his name. Behold the Savior's greatness. It extends to all the world.' *Hom. in Lucam* 6, GCS 35 (= Origen 9): 41–42. Similarly in Origen's *Hom. in Ezech.* 4.1, GCS 33 (Origen 8): 362, SC 352: 162–63.

know of a Barbarion Promontory either in Lusitania or in Mauretania; they certainly know the well-documented Barbaria in East Africa; and they know of a Barbaria in western North Africa although it was probably not Barbary.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

## Primary Sources

- Expositio totius mundi et gentium* (first half fourth century), ed. A. Riese, *Geographia latini minores* (Heilbron, 1878), pp. 104–26; ed. and trans. J. Rougé in *Sources Chrétiennes* 124 (Paris, 1966).
- Itinerarium Antoninianum* (late third century). Dilke pp. 125–28. Olshausen, pp. 88–89. From the period of the Antonine dynasty, 138–222 C.E., perhaps Caracalla (211–217), but final redaction end of third century. Ed. O. Cuntz, *Itineraria Romana*, vol. 1 (Leipzig, 1929), pp. 1–85.
- Itinerarium Theodosii* (ca. 530), in *Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum latinorum* (Vienna, 1866–), 39:125, ‘De situ terrae sanctae’.
- Julius Honorius, *Cosmographia* (fifth century), ed. A. Riese, *Geographia latini minores*, pp. 24–55.
- Laterculus Veronensis* (fourth century), ed. Riese, *Geographia latini minores*, pp. 127–29; ed. O. Seeck, *Notitia Dignitatum*.
- Liber Generationis* (fourth century), ed. Riese, *Geographia latini minores*, pp. 160–70; ed. T. Mommsen, *Chronica Minora: sae. iv. v. vi. vii.*, vol. 1. *Monumenta Germaniae Historica: Auctorum Antiquissimorum* t. 9 (Berlin, 1892; repr. 1961).
- Notitia Dignitatum* (ca. 400 C.E.), ed. O. Seeck (Berlin, 1876).
- Periplus Maris Erythraei* (first century), text, translation and commentary by L. Casson (Princeton, 1989). G. Huntingford, *The Periplus of the Erythraean Sea* (London, 1980). W. H. Schoff, *The Periplus of the Erythraean Sea* (2nd ed., New Delhi, 1974; originally publ. 1912).
- Peutinger Table* (*Tabula Peutingeriana*), fourth–fifth century. Recent studies place it in the time of Theodosius II (408–450). A road map of the Roman world plus some other areas to the north and east. Ed. K. Miller, *Itineraria Romana* (Stuttgart, 1916). Facsimile: *De Tabula Peutingeriana, de kaart*. Vereniging van Vrienden van het Museum Kam. Museumstukken 2 (Nijmegen, 1991). Literature: Thompson, *History of Ancient Geography*, pp. 379 ff; Dilke, pp. 113–20. Olshausen, pp. 89–90. P. Stuart, *De Tabula Peutingeriana, commentaar*. Museumstukken 2.
- Ptolemy, *Geography* (second century C.E.), ed. C. Müller and C. T. Fischer, Bks. 1–5, *Claudii Ptolemaei Geographia* (Paris, 1883–1901); earlier edition of Bks. 1–6 by F. G. Wilburg/C. H. F. Grashof (Essen, 1838), and a complete edition by C. F. A. Nobbe (Leipzig, 1843–45). P. J. Fischer’s study of Ptolemy’s maps, *C. Ptolemaei Geographiae* (Leiden, 1932), 4 vols., included a reproduction of the *Geography* in Codex Urbinus Graecus 82. An English translation was done by E. L. Stevenson, *Claudius Ptolemy: The Geography* (New York, 1932). Literature: Olshausen, pp. 75–77; Dilke, pp. 72–86; E. Polaschek in *RE*, Supplementband 10 (1965): 680–833; H. I. Macadam, ‘Appendix’ in *L’Arabie préislamique et son environnement historique et culturel*, ed. T. Fahd (Leiden, 1989), pp. 316–17.

*Ravenna Cosmography* (ca. 700 C.E., based on earlier sources), ed. Joseph Schentz, *Itineraria Romana*, vol. 2 (Leipzig, 1940). Anonymous itinerary. Citations also include the Parthey-Pinder (PP) pages given by Schentz. Literature: Dilke, pp. 174–76; Olshausen, pp. 70–71.

#### Secondary Sources and Abbreviations

Calderini, A., *Dizionario dei nomi geografici e topografici dell'Egitto greco-romano* (Milan, 1972–87).

CCSL = Corpus Christianorum, Series Latina (Turnhout, 1953– ).

CSCO = Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium (Paris, Louvain, 1903– ).

Desange, J., *Catalogue des tribus africaines de l'antiquité classique a l'ouest du Nil* (Dakar, 1962).

Dilke, A. W., *Greek and Roman Maps* (Ithaca, 1985).

EI = *Encyclopaedia of Islam* (Leiden, first edition 1913–36; second edition 1960– ).

GCS = *Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten drei Jahrhunderte* (Leipzig and Berlin, 1897– ).

Grosvenor, M. B. (ed.), and J. M. Darley (chief cartographer), *National Geographic Atlas of the World* (Washington D.C., 1963).

Gsell, S., *Histoire ancienne de l'Afrique du nord* (1921–28; repr. Osnabrück, 1972).

Hammond, N. G. L., *Atlas of the Greek and Roman World in Antiquity* (Park Ridge NJ, 1981).

Hirschensohn, Y. Ş., *Sheba' Hokhamot* (Geography in the Talmud) (London, 1912).

Jastrow, Marcus, *A Dictionary of the Targumim, the Talmud Babli and Yerushalmi, and the Midrashic Literature* (London and New York, 1903).

JCS = *Journal of Cuneiform Studies*.

Kazhdan, A. P. et al. (eds.), *The Oxford Dictionary of Byzantium*.

Kohut, Alexander, *'Arukh ha-Shalem [Aruch Completum]* (Vienna, 1878–92), an edition and expansion of Nathan b. Yehiel's (1035–1110, Rome) *'Arukh*, including Benjamin Mussafia's (seventeenth century, Hamburg and Amsterdam) annotations *Musaf he-'Arukh* (first published in the Amsterdam 1655 edition of Nathan's work) (repr. New York, 1955).

Levtzion, N. and J. F. P. Hopkins, *Corpus of Early Arabic Sources for West African History* (Cambridge, 1981).

Levy, Jacob, *Chaldäisches Wörterbuch über die Targumim* (Leipzig, 1881).

———, *Wörterbuch über die Talmudim und Midraschim*, nebst Beiträgen von H. L. Fleischer, 2. edition mit Nachträgen und Berichtigungen von L. Goldschmidt (Berlin, 1924).

Neubauer, A., *Le Géographie du Talmud* (Paris, 1868).

Olshausen, Eckart, *Einführung in die historische Geographie der alten Welt* (Darmstadt, 1991).

Ramsay, W. M., *The Historical Geography of Asia Minor* (Amsterdam, 1962).

Rappaport, S. Y., *'Erekh Millin* (Prague, 1852; Warsaw 1914, repr. Jerusalem, 1970).

RE = A. Pauly and G. Wissowa, *Real-Encyclopädie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft* (Stuttgart, 1903–78).

RGTC = *Répertoire géographique des textes cunéiformes* (Wiesbaden, 1977– ), vol. 2: texts from Ur-III period, ed. D. O. Edzard and G. Farber; vol. 4: Old Assyrian

- texts, ed. K. Nashef; vol. 5: Middle Babylonian and Middle Assyrian texts, ed. K. Nashef; vol. 6: Hittite texts, ed. G. F. del Monte and J. Tischler; vol. 10: Nuzi texts, ed. J. Fincke; vol. 11: Susa and Elamite texts, ed. F. Vallat *et al.*; vol. 12/1: Eblaite texts, ed. M. Bonechi.
- Ritter, Carl, *Die Erdkunde von Asien*, Band 7, Abtheilung 1 (Berlin, 1843) = *Die Erdkunde im Verhältnis zur Natur und zur Geschichte des Menschen*, Theil 10, Buch 3.
- RLA = *Reallexikon der Assyriologie* (Berlin and Leipzig, 1932– ).
- SC = *Sources Chrétiennes* (Paris, 1941– ).
- Smith, W., *Dictionary of Greek and Roman Geography* (Boston, 1854).
- TAVO = *Tübinger Atlas des Vorderen Orients*, hrsg. vom Sonderforschungsbereich 19 der Universität Tübingen (Wiesbaden, 1977). *Register zu den Karten / General Index*, ed. H. Kopp and W. Röllig, W. B. Siewert-Mayer *et al.* (Wiesbaden, 1994), 1:219–20.
- Thompson, J. O., *History of Ancient Geography* (New York, 1965).
- Tozer, H. F., *A History of Ancient Geography* (New York, 1971); on Roman itineraries (Antonine, Peutinger, Hierosolymitana), pp. 306–12.
- TLL = *Thesaurus Linguae Latinae* (Leipzig, 1900– ).
- ZA = *Zeitschrift für Assyriologie*.