

*University of Maine
School of Law*

**MAINE
LAW REVIEW**

Volume 66, Number 2, 2014

MAINE
UNIVERSITY OF MAINE SCHOOL OF LAW
LAW

COPYRIGHT NOTICE

Copyright © 2014 by the University of Maine School of Law, 246 Deering Avenue, Portland, Maine 04102.

The Maine Law Review is published semi-annually by the students of the University of Maine School of Law. It is printed by Western Newspaper Publishing Company, Inc., of Indianapolis, Indiana, and mailed periodicals postage paid.

Subscriptions are for the entire volume and are payable in advance. Domestic: \$35.00 (regular); \$60.00 (sponsor); \$110.00 (patron); or \$160.00 (benefactor). Foreign: \$39.00 (overseas); \$39.00 (Canadian). Please inform the Managing Editor of the Law Review promptly of any change of address.

Information concerning back issues is available by writing to William S. Hein & Co., Inc., Hein Building, 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209, or by calling 1-800-828-7571. Microfilm copies may be ordered from either William S. Hein & Co., Inc., or University Microfilm, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106.

Unless a claim of non-receipt of Law Review issues is made within six months of the mailing date, the University of Maine School of Law cannot be responsible for supplying those issues without charge.

Unsolicited manuscripts for publication are always welcomed but not will be returned.

Address business communications to: Editor-in-Chief, Maine Law Review, University of Maine School of Law, 246 Deering Avenue, Portland, Maine 04102.

The University of Maine School of Law is an administrative unit of the University of Southern Maine.

MAINE LAW REVIEW

Volume 66 — 2013-2014

Editor-In-Chief
AMY K. OLFENE

Executive Editor
RACHEL WHITE

Managing Editor
ADAM QUINLAN

*Head Case Note &
Comment Editor*
RYAN ALMY

Symposium Editor
SARA A. MURPHY

Articles Editors
KEVIN DECKER
DAVID FAHERTY
STEPHEN SEGAL

Production Editor
ANNA POLKO

*Case Note &
Comment Editors*
CHRISTOPHER HARMON
ELIZABETH VALENTINE

Technical Editor
MEGHAN MYERS

Research Editors
EMILY GAESKY
ASHLEY JANOTTA

Staff

SAMUEL BALDWIN
PARDIS DELIJANI
JOSEPH GOUSSE
JULIANA O'BRIEN
ARI SOLOTOFF

XI CHEN
BRANDON FARMER
DEREK JONES
LAURA SHAW
KATHLEEN TAYLOR

CAITLIN CLARK
ELIZABETH FRAZIER
MIKALA NOE
AUSTIN SMITH
BENJAMIN WAHRER

Faculty Advisor
PROFESSOR DMITRY BAM

BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE UNIVERSITY OF MAINE

SAMUEL W. COLLINS, <i>Chair</i>	5 Heritage Road, Caribou, Maine
GREGORY G. JOHNSON, <i>Vice Chair</i>	60 Shore Road, Harpswell, Maine
KURT W. ADAMS	First Wind LLC, 129 Middle St., Portland, Maine
ELEANOR M. BAKER	Baker, Newman & Noyes, P.O. Box 507, 280 Fore Street, Portland, Maine
JAMES R. ERWIN	Pierce Atwood, LLP, Merrill's Wharf, 254 Commercial Street, Portland, Maine
NORMAN L. FOURNIER	2002 Aroostook Road, Wallagrass, Maine
MARK R. GARDNER	Sappi Fine Paper North America, 255 State Street, 4 th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts
TYLER C. HADYNYIAK	108 Quebec Street, Farmington, Maine
M. MICHELLE HOOD	Eastern Maine Healthcare Systems, 43 Whiting Hill Road, Brewer, Maine
MARJORIE MURRAY MEDD	P.O. Box 126, Norway, Maine
KEVIN P. MCCARTHY	Unum Group, 2211 Congress Street, Portland, Maine
PAUL J. MITCHELL	GHM Insurance Agency, 51 Main Street, Waterville, Maine
VICTORIA M. MURPHY	Pan Atlantic SMS Group, 6 City Center Suite 200, Portland, Maine
BONNIE D. NEWSOM	950 Main Road, Eddington, Maine
JAMES E. RIER, JR.	Commissioner of Education, State House Station #23, Augusta, Maine
KARL W. TURNER	16 Town Landing Road, Cumberland, Maine

ADMINISTRATION OF THE SCHOOL OF LAW

JAMES H. PAGE, *Chancellor University of Maine System*
B.A., University of Maine at Fort Kent; M.Phil., University of St. Andrews, Scotland; Ph.D.,
Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

THEODORA J. KALIKOW, *President, University of Southern Maine*
A.B., Wellesley College; Sc.M., Massachusetts Institute of Technology; Ph.D., Boston University.

MICHAEL R. STEVENSON, *Provost & Vice President for Academic Affairs, University of Southern Maine*
B.A., Purdue University; M.S., Purdue University; Doctorate, Purdue University.

PETER R. PITEGOFF, *Dean & Professor, University of Maine School of Law*
B.A., Brown University; J.D., New York University.

RITA S. HEIMES, *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs; Director, Center for Law and Innovation*
B.A., University of Iowa; J.D., Drake University Law School.

DAVE OWEN, *Professor of Law; Interim Associate Dean for Research.*
A.B., Amherst College; J.D., University of California, Berkeley School of Law (Boalt Hall).

FACULTY OF THE SCHOOL OF LAW 2013-2014

LEONARD AGNETA, *Director, Maine Patent Program, Adjunct Clinical Professor of Law*
B.S.M.T., University of New Mexico; J.D., University of New Mexico School of Law.

ANGELA C. AREY, *Associate Legal Writing Professor*
B.A., American University; J.D., University of Maine School of Law.

DMITRY BAM, *Associate Professor of Law*
B.S., Syracuse University; B.A., Syracuse University; J.D., Stanford Law School.

E. JAMES BURKE, *Clinical Professor of Law*
B.A., Bates College; J.D., Western New England College School of Law.

DAVID P. CLUCHEY, *Professor of Law*
A.B., Yale University; M.A., State University of New York at Albany; J.D., Harvard University.

CHRISTINE D. DAVIK, *Professor of Law*
B.A., University of Illinois; J.D., University of Illinois School of Law.

ORLANDO E. DELOGU, *Emeritus Professor of Law*
B.S., University of Utah; M.S., J.D., University of Wisconsin.

JAMES FRIEDMAN, *Professor of Law*
A.B., Brown University; J.D., University of Chicago.

MALICK GHACHEM, *Associate Professor of Law*
B.A., Harvard University; J.D., Harvard University; Ph.D., Stanford University.

COLLEEN A. KHOURY, *Emerita Professor of Law*
B.A., Colby College; J.D., Illinois Institute of Technology/Chicago-Kent College of Law.

NINA KOHN, *Visiting Professor of Law*
B.A., Princeton University; J.D., Harvard University

LOIS R. LUPICA, *Professor of Law*
B.S., Cornell University; J.D., Boston University.

JEFFREY A. MAINE, *Professor of Law*
B.B.A., M.B.A., Florida Atlantic University; J.D., Stetson University; LL.M., University of Florida.

CHARLES H. NORCHI *Professor of Law, Director, Center for Oceans & Coastal Law, Director LL.M. Program*
 A.B., Harvard University; J.D., Case Western Reserve University School of Law; J.S.D., LL.M., Yale Law School.

CHRISTOPHER NORTHROP, *Clinical Professor of Law*
 B.A., Grinnell College; J.D., University of North Carolina School of Law.

MARTIN A. ROGOFF, *Professor of Law*
 B.A., Cornell University; M.A., University of California at Berkeley; LL.B., Yale University.

SARAH SCHINDLER, *Associate Professor of Law*
 A.B., University of Georgia, J.D., University of Georgia School of Law.

DEIRDRE M. SMITH, *Director, Cumberland Legal Aid Clinic and Professor of Law*
 B.A., University of Pennsylvania; J.D., University of Maine School of Law.

JEFFREY THALER, *Visiting Professor, University of Maine*
 B.A., Williams College; J.D., Yale Law School

NANCY WANDERER, *Legal Writing Professor*
 B.A., Wellesley College; M.A., George Washington University; J.D., University of Maine School of Law.

THOMAS M. WARD, *Professor of Law*
 B.A., University of Pennsylvania; LL.B., University of Notre Dame; LL.M., University of Illinois.

ANNA R. WELCH, *Libra Visiting Professor of Law*
 B.A., B.S., University of Colorado, Boulder; J.D., American University Washington College of Law.

JENNIFER B. WRIGGINS, *Sumner T. Bernstein Professor of Law*
 B.A., Yale University; J.D., Harvard University

MELVYN ZARR, *Professor of Law*
 A.B., Clark University; LL.B., Harvard University.

DONALD ZILLMAN, *Professor of Law*
 B.S., University of Wisconsin; J.D., University of Wisconsin; LL.M., University of Virginia.

ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF

SHERRY L. ABBOTT, *Associate Dean for Student Services.*

BRENDA BERRY, *Registrar.*

ALISON BEYEA, *Director, Office of Admissions.*

TINA CLAYPOOLE, *Financial Manager, Finance and Administration.*

DESTINY COOK, *Administrative Specialist, Office of Admissions.*

MICHELENE DECROW, *Director, Technology Department.*

HEIDI GAGE, *Administrative Specialist, Faculty*

JENNIFER HEBERT, *Administrative Support Supervisor, Student Services.*

DEBORAH LORENZEN, *Administrative Specialist, Advancement and External Affairs*

KATHRYN MASTERS, *Administrative Specialist, Center for Law & Innovation, Maine Patent Program.*

TREVOR MAXWELL, *Director of Communications & Grant Development.*

LEXIE MORAS, *Identity and Events Manager.*

ANGELA MORGAN, *Administrative Specialist, Cumberland Legal Aid Clinic*

KAREN MURPHY, *Administrative Manager, Cumberland Legal Aid Clinic.*

KAYLA RAMSAY, *Administrative Specialist, Dean's Office.*

RACHEL REEVES, *Senior Advisor for Career & Professional Development.*

MARY ROY, *Assistant Director of Advancement and External Affairs.*

FRANCES DEE SMITH, *Administrative Specialist, Faculty and Registrar.*

CAROL TAYLOR, *Accounting Specialist, Finance and Administration.*

VENDEAN VAFIADES, *Director, Advancement and External Affairs.*

DEREK VAN VOLKENBURGH, *Director, Career Services.*

NICOLE VINAL, *Assistant Dean for Finance and Administration.*

TARA WHEELER, *Administrative Specialist, Career Services.*

KERRY WYLER, *Technology Coordinator, Technology Department.*

LAW LIBRARY STAFF

VICTORIA DURANT, *Law Library Assistant, Technical Services/Government Documents.*

CHRISTINE HEPLER, *Interim Director, Garbrecht Law Library.*

SHERRY MCCALL, *Law Library Assistant, ILL/Circulation.*

SHANNON O'CONNOR, *Law Library Assistant, Cataloguing.*

SUZANNE P. PARENT, *Collection Development Law Librarian.*

MAUREEN QUINLAN, *Reference/Government Documents Law Librarian.*

STEPHEN SALHANY, *Serials/Catalog Law Librarian.*

GREGORY STOWE, *Law Library Assistant, Circulation.*

JULIE WELCH, *Reference Law Librarian.*

LYNN WILCOX, *Assistant Law Librarian, Technical Services.*

BENEFACTORS (\$160 AND ABOVE LEVEL)

Berman & Simmons	Lewiston
Drummond, Woodsum & MacMahon	Portland
Gillis, Borchardt & Barthel LLP	Hingham, MA
Hon. Daniel E. Wathen	Augusta
Ira J. Waldman	Los Angeles, CA
James Tierney	Lisbon Falls
Kelly, Remmel & Zimmerman	Portland
Lambert Coffin	Portland
Paul H. Mills	Farmington
Petrucelli, Martin & Haddow	Portland
Skelton Taintor & Abbott	Auburn
Verrill Dana	Portland

PATRONS (\$110 LEVEL)

Curtis Thaxter	Portland
Hardings Law Offices	Presque Isle
Hon. Howard H. Dana, Jr.	Portland
Monaghan Leahy	Portland
Norman Hanson & DeTroy	Portland
Roberts & Shirley Law Offices	Springvale
Severson, Hand & Nelson, P.A.	Houlton

SPONSORS (\$60 LEVEL)

David J. Evans	Washington D.C.
David P. Silk	Portland
Dean A. Beaupain	Millinocket
Fletcher & Mahar	Calais
Gross, Minsky & Mogul	Bangor
Hon. Donald Alexander	Portland
Hon. John A. Woodcock, Jr.	Bangor
Hon. Wayne Douglas	Biddeford
Law Offices of Charles L. Nickerson	Sanford
Linnell, Choate & Webber	Auburn
McEachern & Thornhill	Kittery
McTeague Higbee	Topsham
Murray, Plumb & Murray	Portland
N. Paul Gauvreau	Lewiston
Nelson-Reade Law Office, P.C.	Portland
Nicholas M. Gess	Washington D.C.
Philip M. Coffin, III	Portland
Schwartz & Schwartz	Portland
Susan E. Peck	Portland
Thompson & Bowie	Portland
Trafton & Matzen	Auburn
Vafiades, Broutas & Kominsky	Bangor
Ward I. Graffam	Portland
Wright & Mills	Skowhegan

CONTENTS

SYMPOSIUM: WHO'S GOVERNING PRIVACY? REGULATION AND PROTECTION IN A DIGITAL ERA	
INTRODUCTION	
FOREWORD	
<i>Peter J. Guffin, Kyle J. Glover, and Sara M. Benjamin</i>	369
ARTICLES	
THE GLASS HOUSE EFFECT: BIG DATA, THE NEW OIL, AND THE POWER OF ANALOGY	
<i>Dennis D. Hirsch</i>	373
LOCAL LAW ENFORCEMENT JUMPS ON THE BIG DATA BANDWAGON: AUTOMATED LICENSE PLATE RECOGNITION SYSTEMS, INFORMATION PRIVACY, AND ACCESS TO GOVERNMENT INFORMATION	
<i>Bryce Clayton Newell</i>	397
THE PROMISE AND SHORTCOMINGS OF PRIVACY MULTISTAKEHOLDER POLICYMAKING: A CASE STUDY	
<i>Omer Tene and J. Trevor Hughes</i>	437
PRIVACY LAW'S PRECAUTIONARY PRINCIPLE PROBLEM	
<i>Adam Thierer</i>	467
PRIVACY AND SECURITY IN THE CLOUD: SOME REALISM ABOUT TECHNICAL SOLUTIONS TO TRANSNATIONAL SURVEILLANCE IN THE POST-SNOWDEN ERA	
<i>Joris V.J. van Hoboken and Ira S. Rubinstein</i>	487
COMMENT	
WAITING FOR GLUSKABE: AN EXAMINATION OF MAINE'S COLONIALIST LEGACY SUFFERED BY NATIVE AMERICAN TRIBES UNDER THE MAINE INDIAN CLAIMS SETTLEMENT ACT OF 1980	
<i>Joseph G.E. Gousse</i>	535
CASE NOTES	
<i>TROTT V. H.D. GOODALL HOSPITAL</i> : WHEN ANALYZING EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION CASES UNDER MAINE LAW, SHOULD MAINE COURTS CONTINUE TO APPLY THE <i>MCDONNELL DOUGLAS</i> ANALYSIS AT THE SUMMARY JUDGMENT STAGE?	
<i>Ari B. Solotoff</i>	571
WHAT IS THE SCOPE OF SEARCHES OF CELL PHONES INCIDENT TO ARREST? <i>UNITED STATES V. WURIE</i> AND THE RETURN OF <i>CHIMEL</i>	
<i>Benjamin Wahrer</i>	591

**SYMPOSIUM: WHO'S GOVERNING PRIVACY?
REGULATION AND PROTECTION IN A DIGITAL
ERA**

INTRODUCTION

On February 21, 2014, the staff and board of the Maine Law Review organized a symposium¹ in Portland, Maine, focused on digital privacy in the U.S. and abroad. The event brought together nine legal scholars from across the country, including Ann Bartow of Pace Law School; Dennis D. Hirsch of Capital University Law School; Bryce Clayton Newell of The Information School at the University of Washington; Omer Tene and J. Trevor Hughes of the International Association of Privacy Professionals; Adam Thierer of the Mercatus Center at George Mason University; Joris V.J. van Hoboken and Ira S. Rubinstein of the Information Law Institute at New York University School of Law; and Christopher Wolf of Hogan Lovells in Washington, D.C. The symposium was organized around three themes of contemporary concern for the field of privacy law, including:

1. Issues raised by Big Data, particularly the risk of data breaches and governmental access to information;
2. Lessons learned from industry attempts at self-regulation; and
3. Transnational surveillance and a multinational response to data access with regard to ‘cloud’ computing.

With this year’s symposium, the Maine Law Review created a forum for an energetic, thoughtful discussion and debate of privacy regulations and protections in an ever-changing technological environment. In planning the symposium, we sought commentary that analyzed and challenged conventional legal and industry responses to privacy regulation, breach containment, and governmental access. These dynamic conversations were bolstered by the participation of an audience of nearly 200 attendees, the majority of which was made up of members from Maine’s business and legal communities.

The Review is grateful for the opportunity to bring this discussion to Portland, Maine. We thank Peter Guffin of Pierce Atwood LLP, Andrew Clearwater of RxAnte, Inc., and Tim Smith of Unum for moderating the symposium’s three panel presentations, and our legal scholars for engaging in a lively discussion around this rapidly evolving area of law.

1. The symposium was made possible through the sponsorship and support of Pierce Atwood LLP, the International Association of Privacy Professionals, Unum, and IDEXX Laboratories, as well as the University of the Maine School of Law and the Maine Law Student Bar Association.

